

# CHCRUS

This is the accepted manuscript made available via CHORUS. The article has been published as:

## Alternative materials for perovskite solar cells from materials informatics

Shohei Kanno, Yutaka Imamura, and Masahiko Hada Phys. Rev. Materials **3**, 075403 — Published 17 July 2019 DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevMaterials.3.075403

1	
2	Do Promising Alternative Materials for Perovskite Solar Cells Exist?
3	An Answer from Materials Informatics
4	
5	Shohei Kanno, Yutaka Imamura, <sup>*</sup> Masahiko Hada
6	Department of Chemistry, Tokyo Metropolitan University, Hachioji, Tokyo, Japan
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	

#### 14 ABSTRACT

15Perovskite solar cells based on lead-halide perovskites have attracted significant attention as prime candidates for next-generation solar cells because of their high-power conversion efficiency. 1617To avoid the toxicity of lead-based perovskites, alternatives such as tin-halide perovskite have been investigated. However, the photovoltaic performance of these alternatives is relatively low, and novel 18perovskites with low cost, low toxicity, and high performance have not vet been discovered. In this 19study, to investigate whether promising alternative perovskites exist, a high-throughput material 20search scheme based on materials informatics was developed and performed for novel perovskite 21solar cell materials. Using this scheme, over 28 million AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskite-like 22compositions were screened. Among the 24 most promising candidates identified, 5 were 2324well-known organic-inorganic tin-halide perovskites and 17 were novel sodium-, potassium-, and ammonium-based tin-halide perovskites. Interestingly, two novel transition-metal-based perovskites 25were also identified as promising solar cell materials. The pioneering material search scheme 26reported is expected to find use in the identification of practically feasible materials for a number of 27real-world applications. 28

#### 30 Introduction

Organic-inorganic hybrid perovskites such as methylammonium lead iodide (MAPbI<sub>3</sub>) have 3132enormous potential as solar cell materials because of their suitable band gaps for solar light absorption [1], very small exciton binding energies [2], and long carrier diffusion lengths [3]. The 33 34power conversion efficiency (PCE) of perovskite solar cells (PSCs) skyrocketed from 3.8% in 2009 35to 23.3% in 2018 [4,5]. Therefore, PSCs are prime candidates for next-generation solar cells and are 36 expected to provide a solution to the energy problem. However, the toxicity of lead-based hybrid perovskites is a serious obstacle to their practical application [6]. To avoid the toxicity of lead, 3738lead-free hybrid perovskites in which other ions are substituted for lead have been examined both 39 experimentally and using computational simulations [7–15]. However, the PCEs of lead-free PSCs 40 based on CH<sub>3</sub>NH<sub>3</sub>SnI<sub>3</sub>, which is widely used as an alternative to lead-based perovskites, are 41significantly lower than the PCEs of lead-based PSCs [5,7]. Additionally, SnI<sub>2</sub>, which is the main 42degradation product of tin-based perovskites, may present even greater toxicity concerns than lead-based perovskites [16]. Therefore, the development of novel perovskites with high photovoltaic 4344 performance is required.

Recently, data-driven machine learning and materials informatics have succeeded in the discovery of novel materials such as solid-state electrolytes [17], organic light-emitting diodes [18], shape memory alloys [19], piezoelectrics [20], and polymers for organic photovoltaics [21]. These approaches have also been employed for crystal structure prediction [22–25], physical property prediction [26–31], and high-throughput computational screening [32,33]. Accordingly, massive and
efficient material design based on machine learning and materials informatics has attracted
significant attention in the field of materials science.

52In this study, we developed a massive and highly efficient material search scheme based on materials informatics and applied it to the screening of over 28 million AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double 53perovskite candidates. In this material search scheme, in addition to the semiconductor properties of 5455the candidates such as the band gap and carrier effective mass, the synthetic feasibility, toxicity, and 56cost, which were rarely considered in previous studies, were systematically analyzed using an 57informatics strategy based on a combination of experimental and the theoretical databases newly 58built from our calculations. To date, many lead-free and tin-free perovskites have been reported from 59material searches based on computational simulations [13-15]. However, there have been no 60 successful experimental reports regarding the alternative perovskites proposed from these 61 computational simulations, possibly because these previous reports used only theoretical databases 62from first-principles calculations. In particular, it is difficult to calculate the band gaps of hybrid perovskites because of the electron correlation and the strong spin-orbit coupling [34]. In this study, 63 we estimate band gaps based on the experimental databases to guide novel material searches for 64 65PSCs. Through the screening of 28 million candidates, we identified alternative perovskites with suitable semiconductor properties, stable cubic or pseudo cubic structures, low toxicity, and low cost 66 for use in PSCs. 67

#### 69 Methods

#### 70 Machine learning models for band gap prediction

To train the machine learning model for band gap prediction, a training dataset of high quality is required. Past studies have employed band gap datasets evaluated by first-principles calculations [35,36]. However, studies indicated that electron correlation and relativistic spin-orbit coupling (SOC) play important roles in the band gap calculations of PSC materials [34]. To determine the efficacy of the band gap learning model, we used an experimental band gap dataset of 282 perovskites. The details are summarized in Table S1 and Figure S1 (see Supplemental Material) [37].

78To define the feature vectors for each AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskite, we used atomic and 79ionic features of the six constituent ions (A, A', B, B', X, and X') of the perovskite. For each ion, we 80 used nine elemental features (viz. first ionization potential, electron affinity, Mulliken 81 electronegativity, ionic radius, group number, Pettifor's Mendeleev number [38], ionic HOMO level, ionic LUMO level, and ionic HOMO-LUMO gap). Therefore, an AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskite is 82 described by a 54-dimensional feature vector in the target chemical space. To determine the first 83 ionization potentials and electron affinities for organic molecules and ionic HOMO/LUMO levels for 84 all ions, density functional theory (DFT) calculations were carried out. The computational details and 85features for each element and organic molecule are summarized in Table S2 (see Supplemental 86 Material). 87

88	Using the band gap data set and the feature vectors, we validated machine learning models
89	for band gap prediction. Figure 1 illustrates the validation process. In this process, the band gap
90	dataset was randomly split into a training set and a test set in ratios of 80% and 20%. Ten pairs of a
91	fitting set and a validation set with ratios of 60% and 40% were generated from random splits in the
92	training set. Using the fitting sets, validation sets, and test sets, the accuracy of the band gap
93	predictor was validated. As the preprocess for regression coefficient fitting and cross-validation, the
94	features were scaled by normalization, and the dimension of the feature vector was reduced from 54
95	dimensions to 15 dimensions by principal component analysis (PCA). After the preprocessing,
96	machine learning models were trained via fitting and cross-validation using the 10 pairs of the fitting
97	set and the validation set. Next, the trained machine learning models were tested using the test set. In
98	order to investigate the generality of the machine learning models, this process was iterated for 50
99	cycles with different random seeds to split the band gap data set, and the accuracies of the machine
100	learning models were assessed by averaging $R^2$ values for the training sets $(R_{\text{train}}^2)$ and test sets
101	$(R_{\text{test}}^2)$ .

The averaged  $R_{\text{train}}^2$ , averaged  $R_{\text{test}}^2$ , and root mean squared errors (RMSEs) in the test set for each regression model are listed in Table 1. In this assessment, we employed multiple linear regression (MLR), Ridge regression, Lasso regression, support vector machine regression (SVR) with a linear kernel or Gaussian kernel, and Gaussian process regression (GPR) with a Gaussian kernel as regression models. These are implemented in the scikit-learn library [39]. In addition, 107 ensemble learning models such as random forest and neural network are also known as powerful regression models. However, in this study, the number of data sets was insufficient to perform these 108regressions, and they were not reasonable for this study. For linear-regression-based prediction 109models (MLR, Ridge regression, Lasso regression, and SVR with a linear kernel), the averaged 110  $R_{\text{train}}^2$  and averaged  $R_{\text{test}}^2$  are very low; hence, these models cannot predict the band gaps of 111 112perovskites. On the other hand, for nonlinear regression-based prediction models (SVR and GPR 113with a Gaussian kernel), the prediction accuracies are dramatically improved. This result implies that 114nonlinear correlation between the band gap and the features is important for band gap prediction, and 115similar perovskites show similar band gaps. In particular, SVR with a Gaussian kernel shows the best prediction accuracy in our examination, and the averaged  $R_{\text{train}}^2$ , averaged  $R_{\text{test}}^2$ , and RMSE in the 116 test set are 0.89, 0.65, and 0.81 eV, respectively. We employed this SVR with a Gaussian kernel as 117118 the band gap predictor. To improve the prediction accuracy, additional band gap data are required. 119We believe that our machine learning model will be improved by an expanded band gap dataset in the future. 120

121

#### 122 Computational details for first-principles calculations

First-principles calculations were carried out to perform structural optimization and determine the band gap, electron and hole effective mass, and exciton binding energy. For structural optimization, the ion positions and cell parameters in a  $2 \times 1 \times 1$  cubic-based unit cell (Figure S2)

126	were optimized with the convergence threshold for a change of $10^{-3}$ eV in the total energy. After the
127	structural optimizations, the direct band gap, indirect band gap, electron and hole effective mass, and
128	exciton binding energy were calculated using the optimized structure. These calculations were
129	performed using the Perdew-Burke-Ernzerhof (PBE) exchange correlation functional with the
130	DFT-D3 method as a van der Waals correction [40,41], projector augmented wave (PAW)
131	pseudopotentials, 700-eV plane-wave cutoff, and 10 $\times$ 10 $\times$ 10 sampling k-point grid in Vienna ab
132	initio simulation package (VASP) code [42,43].
133	For the most promising novel perovskites, more accurate DFT calculations were carried out
134	to evaluate the formation enthalpies, light absorption coefficients, and levels of conduction band
135	minimum (CBM) and valence band maximum (VBM). A computationally inexpensive theoretical
136	approach based on PBE + $U$ calculations with fitted elemental-phase reference energies (FERE) was
137	used for reoptimizations of the structure and estimations of the formation enthalpy [44]. Here, the
138	values of the effective on-site Coulomb interactions $(U)$ were taken from [44], and the most stable
139	crystal structures of each pure element were taken from the Materials Project [45]. The other
140	computational details are similar to the above calculations. Furthermore, a Heyd-Scuseria-Ernzerhof
141	(HSE06) screened hybrid functional with a $2 \times 4 \times 4$ sampling k-point grid was used to evaluate the
142	light absorption coefficients and the levels of CBM and VBM [46]. The light absorption coefficients
143	were estimated based on the calculations of the imaginary part of the frequency-dependent dielectric

matrix implemented in VASP code [47]. The levels of CBM and VBM were determined using
empirical equations [48,49]:

$$E_{\rm C} = \left(\chi_{\rm A} \chi_{\rm A'} \chi_{\rm B} \chi_{\rm B'} \chi_{\rm X}^3 \chi_{\rm X'}^3\right)^{\frac{1}{10}} + \frac{1}{2} E_{\rm g} \quad (1),$$
$$E_{\rm V} = E_{\rm C} - E_{\rm g} \quad (2).$$

146 where  $E_{\rm C}$  and  $E_{\rm V}$  are the CBM level and VBM level relative to the vacuum level, respectively.  $\chi_{\rm A}$ , 147  $\chi_{\rm A'}$ ,  $\chi_{\rm B}$ ,  $\chi_{\rm B'}$ ,  $\chi_{\rm X}$ , and  $\chi_{\rm X'}$  denote the absolute electronegativities of A, A', B, B', X, and X' atoms in 148 AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskite, respectively [50], and  $E_{\rm g}$  is the band gap calculated by an HSE06 149 functional.

#### 151 **Results and discussion**

We developed a high-throughput material search for novel PSC materials. Figure 2 depicts 152the novel AA'BB' $X_3X'_3$  double perovskite search scheme. In this material search scheme, not only 153the feasibility of the perovskite structure and its band gap but also its toxicity and cost were 154systematically considered. First, AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> compositions were generated from a library of ions. 155For the A and A' cations, 18 cations including alkali metal, alkali earth metal, group-3 metal, and 156organic cations were employed. For the B and B' cations, 85 cations including transition metals and 157p-block metals were employed. For the X and X' anions, nine anions including chalcogens and 158halogens were employed. The specific ions are listed in Figure 2 (a). From the ion library, 15928,125,225 AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> compositions were generated. These were screened in a stepwise manner 160 161 according to the material search scheme.

In the first screening step of the material search scheme, the ability of the generated AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> compositions to form a perovskite was evaluated using the general properties of the constituent ions (*viz.* ionic valence, valence electron number, and ionic radius). A composition was considered to be synthetically feasible if it met the following seven criteria: (1) its charge was neutral, (2) it had an even number of electrons, (3) its tolerance factor *TF* fell between 0.8 and 1.1 [51], (4) its octahedral factor *OF* was greater than 0.4 [51], (5) the ionic radii difference and ratio of its A and A' cations met the criteria in eq. (3); (6) the ionic radii difference and ratio of its B and B' cations met 169 the criteria in eq. (4); and (7) its X and X' anions had the same group number. TF and OF are defined

170 as

$$TF = \frac{r_{\overline{A}} + r_{\overline{X}}}{\sqrt{2}(r_{\overline{B}} + r_{\overline{X}})} \quad (3)$$
$$OF = \frac{r_{\overline{B}}}{r_{\overline{X}}} \quad (4).$$

where  $r_{\overline{A}}$  is the average ionic radius of the A and A' cations,  $r_{\overline{B}}$  is the average ionic radius of the B 171and B' cations, and  $r_{\overline{X}}$  is the average ionic radius of the X and X' anions. Shannon's ionic radii and 172173effective radii were used for atomic ions and molecular ions, respectively [52,53]. However, TF and 174OF were defined for ABX<sub>3</sub> single perovskites, and these factors do not consider the differences 175between the ionic radii of A and A', B and B', or X and X' in AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskites. 176Recently, Bartel et al. reported a new tolerance factor to predict the stability of A<sub>2</sub>BB'X<sub>6</sub>-type double 177perovskites [54]. Even with Bartel's tolerance factor, it may be impossible to predict the stabilities of 178AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskites because Bartel's tolerance factor cannot consider the differences 179between A and A' or X and X'. Therefore, the conventional TF and OF parameters and Bartel's new tolerance factor cannot simply be applied to AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskites; additional conditions 180are required. The 5th and 6th conditions consider the differences in the ionic radii of A and A' and B 181182and B', respectively, by applying the following rules:

$$0.73 \le \frac{r_{\rm A}}{r_{\rm A'}} \le 1.37, \qquad |r_{\rm A} - r_{\rm A'}| \le 0.45 \text{ Å} \quad (5)$$
$$0.50 \le \frac{r_{\rm B}}{r_{\rm B'}} \le 2.00, \qquad |r_{\rm B} - r_{\rm B'}| \le 2.00 \text{ Å} \quad (6).$$

183	where $r_A$ , $r_{A'}$ , $r_B$ , and $r_{B'}$ are the ionic radii of the A, A', B, and B' cations, respectively. The 5th,
184	6th, and 7th conditions were determined from our dataset of 282 experimental perovskite compounds
185	(see Table S1 in the Supplemental Material). AA'BB'X <sub>3</sub> X' <sub>3</sub> compositions that satisfy the seven
186	criteria are expected to be able to form a perovskite structure; 128,357 such AA'BB'X <sub>3</sub> X' <sub>3</sub> were
187	identified in this step, and only these combinations proceeded to the next screening step.
188	In the second screening step, the band gaps of the 128,357 AA'BB'X <sub>3</sub> X' <sub>3</sub> double perovskites
189	were predicted using a machine learning model. Support vector machine regression (SVR) with a
190	Gaussian kernel trained on the experimental band gap data of 282 perovskite compounds was
191	employed as the machine learning model. The band gaps and compositions of 282 perovskites are
192	listed in Table S1 (see Supplemental Material). The feature vectors for the 128,357 AA'BB'X $_3X'_3$
193	double perovskites were generated from the atomic and ionic information of the constituent elements.
194	The details are summarized in the Supplemental Material. To identify novel double perovskites with
195	suitable band gaps, we set a band gap criterion of 1.4 $\pm$ 0.8 eV. The values of 1.4 and 0.8 eV
196	correspond to the ideal band gap for p-n-junction-based solar cell materials according to the
197	Shockley-Queisser limit and the error bar of our SVR, respectively [55]. Through this screening,
198	10,918 AA'BB'X <sub>3</sub> X' <sub>3</sub> double perovskites with suitable band gaps were identified. The 10,918
199	perovskites included conventional hybrid perovskites such as MA2Pb2I6 (=MAPbI3), for which the
200	band gaps determined experimentally and by our SVR were 1.48 and 1.69 eV, respectively [56].

In many material search studies, the development of such a database of 10,918 AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskites might be the end goal. However, to target materials with the potential for practical application, we considered two additional criteria (toxicity and cost) in this work. These criteria were selected because the toxicity of the widely used Pb-based hybrid perovskites is a serious problem [6], and low manufacturing cost is a merit of PSCs.

In the third screening step, the 10,918 identified perovskites were evaluated in terms of their 206207toxicity and cost. The Guideline for Elemental Impurities Q3D was employed for the toxicity 208estimation [57]. These guidelines classify elements into four classes: highly toxic Class-1 elements, 209 moderately toxic Class-2 elements, low-toxicity Class-3 elements, and low or nontoxic other 210elements. Pb, Hg, As, and Cd are Class-1 elements, and Co, V, Ni, Tl, Au, Pd, Ir, Os, Rh, Ru, Se, Ag, 211and Pt are Class-2 elements. In this evaluation, AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> perovskites including a Class-1 or -2 212element, such as MA<sub>2</sub>Pb<sub>2</sub>I<sub>6</sub> and other Pb-based perovskites, were rejected, and 2,146 low-toxicity 213double perovskites consisting of only Class-3 and other elements were found. After the toxicity evaluation, the cost of the remaining 2,146 double perovskites was estimated using the Chemicool 214database [58]. This database lists the price of each element in pure and bulk form. Using this 215database, the cost of each of the 2,146 double perovskites was estimated in US dollars (USD) per 216217mole, and the 500 AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'3 double perovskites with the lowest cost were selected. Note that the prices of each element were collected for these estimations in February 2018 and may change over 218time. The latest prices can be seen in the Chemicool database [58]. Here, the toxicities and costs of 219

perovskites were considered in the screening scheme. However, we would suggest that this screening
 step is not necessarily required in general material studies since the toxicities and costs are not
 physical properties and relatively evaluated.

223In the final screening step, first-principles calculations were performed to calculate the 224structures, band gaps, carrier effective masses, and exciton binding energies of the 500 AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskites. The band gaps predicted by machine learning, estimated costs, optimized 225226structures, and semiconductor properties as calculated by density functional theory (DFT) for the 500 227 candidates are listed in Table S4 (see Supplemental Material), and the computational details are 228summarized in the Supplemental Material. From among the 500 candidates, the 24 most promising 229 $AA'BB'X_3X'_3$  double perovskites were identified and are listed in Table 2 along with their band gaps, 230costs, structural properties, hole and electron effective masses, exciton binding energies, and 231theoretical PCEs. The 24 perovskites identified meet the following criteria: (1) a cubic or pseudo 232cubic optimized structure with Bravais lattice vector length ratios of  $1.90 \le |\mathbf{a}|/|\mathbf{b}| \le 2.10, 1.90$  $|\mathbf{a}|/|\mathbf{c}| \leq 2.10$ , and  $0.95 \leq |\mathbf{b}|/|\mathbf{c}| \leq 1.05$ , and angles between the Bravais lattice vectors of 233 $89.0^{\circ} \leq \alpha, \beta, \gamma \leq 91.0^{\circ}$ ; (2) a hole and electron effective mass of less than 1.00 a.u.; and (3) equal 234direct band gap and indirect band gap values. Of the 24 perovskites identified, five are organic 235tin-halide hybrid perovskites such as methylammonium tin iodide (MASnI<sub>3</sub>) and formamidinium tin 236iodide (FASnI<sub>3</sub>). These organic tin-halide hybrid perovskites are well-known and are already 237employed as alternative perovskites in PSCs. Their identification reproduces the results of alternative 238

239	experimental perovskite searches in recent years, and suggests that our material search scheme is a
240	very reliable method. In addition, sodium-, potassium-, and ammonium-based multi-A-cation
241	tin-halide perovskites that have not been reported in previous studies, namely, KMASn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub> ,
242	KMASn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> , KMASn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> , KNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub> , KNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> , KNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> , and NaNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> , were
243	identified. Furthermore, 10 inorganic tin-halide perovskites, namely, KSnBr <sub>3</sub> , K <sub>2</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> , K <sub>2</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Cl <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> ,
244	KSnI <sub>3</sub> , NaKSn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub> , NaKSn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> , NaKSn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> , Na <sub>2</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> , Na <sub>2</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Cl <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub> , and NaSnI <sub>3</sub> , are first
245	reported in this study. These perovskites contain the well-known tin-halide framework. Therefore,
246	the existence of these perovskites is easy to imagine. In addition to the tin-halide perovskites, two
247	novel inorganic perovskites were identified. One is a copper-halide-based perovskite, CaSrCu <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> , and
248	the other is a sulfide perovskite, CaBaMnNbS <sub>6</sub> . These perovskites include divalent A- and A'-cations
249	and transition metals as the B- and B'-cations. The compositions are significantly different from
250	those conventionally used in the PSC field, and they have not been investigated as PSC materials.
251	However, we expect that CaSrCu <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> , CaBaMnNbS <sub>6</sub> , and similar perovskites will show appropriate
252	properties for use as solar cell materials.

For the novel organic-inorganic tin-halide, inorganic tin-halide,  $CaSrCu_2I_6$ , and CaBaMnNbS<sub>6</sub> perovskites, more detailed examinations are needed to investigate the thermochemical stabilities, light absorbance, and levels of CBM and VBM. Table 3 lists the formation enthalpies calculated by PBE + *U* with FERE, band gaps calculated by the HSE06 functional, gap types, and levels of CBM and VBM relative to the vacuum level for the novel perovskite candidates. In addition,

Figure S3 illustrates the imaginary parts of the frequency-dependent dielectric function 258corresponding to the light absorption spectra for each novel perovskite. Notably, the HSE06 259functional might seriously underestimate the band gaps of CaSrCu<sub>2</sub>I<sub>6</sub> and CaBaMnNbS<sub>6</sub> because of 260261the strong electron correlations of Cu and Mn atoms. The formation enthalpies are exothermic for all 262novel perovskites, and the candidates discovered in this study can be thermochemically stable as perovskite structures. All novel organic-inorganic tin-halide and inorganic tin-halide perovskites 263264show direct band gaps and are expected to have relatively large light absorption coefficients in the visible light region (see Figure S3). However, the band gaps calculated by HSE06 are smaller than 265those predicted by machine learning. Therefore, the HSE06 calculations might underestimate the 266267band gaps of the novel organic-inorganic tin-halide and inorganic tin-halide perovskites. By contrast, for the CaSrCu<sub>2</sub>I<sub>6</sub> and CaBaMnNbS<sub>6</sub> perovskites, the gap types are indirect band gaps, and the light 268269absorption coefficients are expected to be relatively small (see Figure S3). However, CaSrCu<sub>2</sub>I<sub>6</sub> and 270CaBaMnNbS<sub>6</sub> perovskites show thermochemical stability and small effective masses of electrons and 271holes. These characteristics are related to high carrier mobility. Therefore, CaSrCu<sub>2</sub>I<sub>6</sub>, CaBaMnNbS<sub>6</sub>, 272and similar perovskites can be expected as potential candidates for photovoltaic materials, and we suggest that experimental studies are needed for these novel perovskites. 273

#### 275 Conclusion

In this study, we examined if promising alternative perovskites with low cost, low toxicity, 276277and high photovoltaic performance exist. To investigate this efficiently, a high-throughput material search scheme based on materials informatics was developed and applied to the screening of 27828,125,225 AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskite candidates. This scheme systematically considered not 279280only the semiconductor properties of the candidates (such as the band gap and carrier effective mass) 281but also the feasibility of their synthesis, toxicity, and cost, which have rarely been considered in 282previous studies. This study used a combination of informatics strategies based on experimental databases and a newly built theoretical database. 283

284To accelerate the material search, the synthetic feasibility, toxicity, and cost were estimated from elemental and atomic information. Furthermore, band gaps were predicted by an SVR machine 285286learning model with a Gaussian kernel. The machine learning model was trained on the experimental 287band gap data of 282 perovskites. We believe that this dataset will be useful in follow-on studies in material research. Our high-throughput material search scheme can systematically consider the 288289physical properties, toxicity, and cost, and can be modified for use in other material searches. For 290example, it could be extended to search for novel perovskite materials for the water-splitting 291photocatalytic reaction by simply changing the band gap screening criteria. Our work represents a 292pioneering material search method based on materials informatics that can consider various criteria 293with the aim of identifying materials for practical applications.

294	Through the materials search scheme, 24 promising candidates were discovered from
295	28,125,225 AA'BB'X <sub>3</sub> X' <sub>3</sub> -type compositions. Among the 24 discovered perovskites, 22 candidates
296	were tin-halide perovskites, five of which are already well-known and employed as alternative
297	materials for PSCs. Their identification is consistent with the results of recent experimental studies
298	[7,8,59-61] and confirmed the reliability of our material search scheme. Novel sodium, potassium,
299	and ammonium-based tin-halide perovskites were also identified. Therefore, we propose that not
300	only MA-, FA-, and caesium-based perovskites but also sodium-, potassium-, and ammonium-based
301	perovskites represent promising alternative PSC materials. In addition to the tin-halide perovskites,
302	two novel transition-metal-based perovskites, CaSrCu <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub> and CaBaMnNbS <sub>6</sub> , were identified.
303	Therefore, the answer to the question, "Do promising alternative perovskites other than tin-halide
304	perovskites exist?" is "yes." We report that there are alternative perovskites other than tin-halide
305	perovskites that show low toxicity, low cost, and high performance as PSCs from the standpoint of
306	materials informatics. This result represents valuable information to guide experimental alternative
307	perovskite searches.

#### Acknowledgements 309

310	Calculations were performed at the Research Center for Computational Science, Okazaki,
311	Japan. This study was supported in part by competitive funding for team-based basic research
312	through the "Creation of Innovative Functions of Intelligent Materials on the Basis of the Element
313	Strategy" from CREST, the Japan Science and Technology (JST) Agency; a Grant-in-Aid for
314	Scientific Research in Innovative Areas of "Coordination Asymmetry" KAKENHI JP17H05380
315	from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT), Japan; and a
316	Grant-in-Aid from the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science (JSPS) KAKENHI Grant Number
317	JP18J12426. We would like to thank Editage (www.editage.jp) for English language editing.
318	

#### **Conflicts of interest** 319

320	There are no	conflicts to	declare.

#### 322 **References**

- 323 [1] S. De Wolf, J. Holovsky, S.-J. Moon, P. Löper, B. Niesen, M. Ledinsky, F.-J. Haug, J.-H. Yum
- and C. Ballif, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2014, 5, 1035-1039.
- 325 [2] Q. Lin, A. Armin, R. C. R. Nagiri, P. L. Burn and P. Meredith, *Nat. Photonics*, 2015, 9, 106-112.
- 326 [3] G. Xing, N. Mathews, Sun, S. S. Lim, Y. M. Lam, M. Grätzel, S. Mhaisalkar and T. C. Sum,
- 327 *Science*, 2013, **342**, 344-347.
- 328 [4] A. Kojima, K. Teshima, Y. Shirai and T. Miyasaka, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2009, 131, 6050-6051.
- 329 [5] NREL efficiency chart, https://www.nrel.gov/pv/assets/images/efficiency-chart.png, (accessed
  330 September 2018).
- 331 [6] A. Babayigit, A. Ethirajan, M. Muller and B. Conings, *Nat. Mater.*, 2016, **15**, 247-251.
- 332 [7] N. K. Noel, S. D. Stranks, A. Abate, C. Wehrenfennig, S. Guarnera, A.-A. Haghighirad, A.
- 333 Sadhanala, G. E. Eperon, S. K. Pathak, M. B. Johnston, A. Petrozza, L. M. Herz and H. J. Snaith,
- *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2014, 7, 3061-3068.
- 335 [8] Z. Zhao, F. Gu, Y. Li, W. Sun, S. Ye, H. Rao, Z. Liu, Z. Bian and C. Huang, *Adv. Sci.*, 2017, 4,
  336 1700204.
- 337 [9] A. H. Slavney, T. Hu, A. M. Lindenberg and H. I. Karunadasa, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2016, 138,
  338 2138-2141.
- 339[10] M. R. Filip, S. Hillman, A. A. Haghighirad, H. J. Snaith and F. Giustino, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*,
  2016, 7, 2579-2585.

- 341[11] G. Volonakis, A. A. Haghighirad, R. L. Milot, W. H. Sio, M. R. Filip, B. Wenger, M. B. Johnston,
- 342 L. M. Herz, H. J. Snaith and F. Giustino, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2017, 8, 772-778.
- 343[12] C. C. Stoumpos, L. Frazer, D. J. Clark, Y. S. Kim, S. H. Rhim, A. J. Freeman, J. B. Ketterson, J.
- 344 I. Jang and M. G. Kanatzidis, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2015, **137**, 6804-6819.
- 345[13] T. Nakajima and K. Sawada, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2017, 8, 4826-4831.
- 346[14] M. R. Filip and F. Giustino, J. Phys. Chem. C, 2016, 120, 166-173.
- 347[15] K. Takahashi, L. Takahashi, I. Miyazato and Y. Tanaka, ACS Photonics, 2018, 5, 771-775.
- 348[16] A. Babayigit, D. D. Thanh, A. Ethirajan, J. Manca, M. Muller, H.-G. Boyen and B. Conings, *Sci.*
- 349 *Rep.*, 2016, **6**, 18721.
- 350[17] M. S. Beal, B. E. Hayden, T. L. Gall, C. E. Lee, X. Lu, M. Mirsaneh, C. Mormiche, D. Pasero, D.
- 351 C. A. Smith, A. Weld, C. Yada and S. Yokoishi, *ACS Comb. Sci.*, 2011, **13**, 375-381.
- 352[18] R. Gómez-Bombarelli, J. Aguilera-Iparraguirre, T. D. Hirzel, D. Duvenaud, D. Maclaurin, M. A.
- Blood-Forsythe, H. S. Chae, M. Einzinger, D.-G. Ha, T. Wu, G. Markopoulos, S. Jeon, H. Kang,
- H. Miyazaki, M. Numata, S. Kim, W. Huang, S. I. Hong, M. Baldo, R. P. Adams and A.
- 355 Aspuru-Guzik, Nat. Mater., 2016, **15**, 1120-1127.
- 356[19] D. Xue, P. V. Balachandran, J. Hogden, J. Theiler, D. Xue and T. Lookman, *Nat. Commun.*, 2016,
- **7**, 11241.
- 358[20] D. Xue, P. V. Balachandran, R. Yuan, T. Hu, X. Qian, E. R. Dougherty and T. Lookman, Proc.
- 359 Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 2016, **113**, 13301-13306.

- 360[21] S. Nagasawa, E. Al-Naamani and A. Saeki, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2018, 9, 2639-2646.
- 361[22] S. Curtarolo, D. Morgan, K. Persson, J. Rodgers and G. Ceder, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2003, 91,
  362 135503.
- 363[23] C. C. Fischer, K. J. Tibbetts, D. Morgan and G. Ceder, Nat. Mater., 2006, 5, 641-646.
- 364[24] G. Pilania, P. V. Balachandran, C. Kim and T. Lookman, Front. Mater.; 2016, 3, 19.
- 365[25] F. A. Faber, A. Lindmaa, O. A. von Lilienfeld and R. Armiento, Phys. Rev. Lett., 2016, 117,
- 366 135502.
- 367[26] M. Fernandez, P. G. Boyd, T. D. Daff, M. Z. Aghaji and T. K. Woo, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*, 2014, 5,
  368 3056-3060.
- 369[27] A. Seko, A. Togo, H. Hayashi, K. Tsuda, L. Chaput and I. Tanaka, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2015, 115, 205901.
- 371[28] G. Pilania, A. Mannodi-Kanakkithodi, B. P. Uberuaga, R. Ramprasad, J. E. Gubernatis and T.
- 372 Lookman, Sci. Rep., 2016, 6, 19375.
- 373[29] C. Kim, G. Pilania and R. Ramprasad, J. Phys. Chem. C, 2016, 120, 14575-14580.
- 374[30] M. de Jong, W. Chen, R. Notestine, K. Persson, G. Ceder, A. Jain, M. Asta and A. Gamst, Sci.
- 375 *Rep.*, 2016, **6**, 34256.
- 376[31] G. Pilania, J. E. Gubernatis and T. Lookman, Comput. Mater. Sci., 2017, 129, 156-163.
- 377[32] A. D. Sendek, Q. Yang, E. D. Cubuk, K.-A. N. Duerloo, Y. Cuic and E. J. Reed, *Energy Environ*.
- *Sci.*, 2017, **10**, 306-320.

- 379[33] A. A. Emery, J. E. Saal, S. Kirklin, V. I. Hegde and C. Wolverton, *Chem. Mater.*, 2016, 28, 5621-5634.
- 381[34] E. Mosconi, P. Umaribc and F. De Angelis, J. Mater. Chem. A, 2015, **3**, 9208-9215.
- 382[35] G. Pilania, A. Mannodi-Kanakkithodi, B. P. Uberuaga, R. Ramprasad, J. E. Gubernatis and T.
- 383 Lookman, Sci. Rep., 2016, 6, 19375.
- 384[36] G. Pilania, J. E. Gubernatis and T. Lookman, *Comput. Mater. Sci.*, 2017, **129**, 156-163.
- 385[37] See Supplemental Material at [URL] for more information regarding the dataset and feature
- vector for machine learning, computational detail of first-principle calculation and power
- 387 conversion efficiency estimation.
- 388[38] D. G. Pettifor, J. Phys. C: Solid State Phys., 1986, 19, 285.
- 389[39] F. Pedregosa, G. Varoquaux, A. Gramfort, V. Michel, B. Thirion, O. Grisel, M. Blondel, P.
- 390 Prettenhofer, R. Weiss, V. Dubourg, J. Vanderplas, A. Passos, D. Cournapeau, M. Brucher, M.
- 391 Perrot and É. Duchesnay, J. Mach. Learn. Res., 2011, **12**, 2825-2830.
- 392[40] J. P. Perdew, K. Burke and M. Ernzerhof, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 1996, 77, 3865.
- 393[41] S. Grimme, J. Antony, S. Ehrlich and H. Krieg, J. Chem. Phys., 2010, 132, 154104.
- 394[42] P. E. Blöchl, *Phys. Rev. B*, 1994, **50**, 17953.
- 395[43] G. Kresse and J. Hafner, *Phys. Rev. B*, 1993, **47**, 558.
- 396[44] V. Stevanović, S. Lany, X. Zhang and A. Zunger, *Phys. Rev. B*, 2012, **85**, 115104.
- 397[45] A. Jain, S. P. Ong, G. Hautier, W. Chen, W. D. Richards, S. Dacek, S. Cholia, D. Gunter, D.

- 398 Skinner, G. Ceder and K. A. Persson, *APL Materials*, 2013, 1, 011002.
- 399[46] A. V. Krukau, O. A. Vydrov, A. F. Izmaylov and G. E. Scuseria, J. Chem. Phys., 2006, 125,
  400 224106.
- 401[47] M. Gajdoš, K. Hummer, G. Kresse, J. Furthmüller and F. Bechstedt, *Phys. Rev. B*, 2006, 73,
  402 045112.
- 403[48] M. A. Butler and D. S. Ginley, J. Electrochem. Soc., 1978, 125, 228-232.
- 404[49] Y. Xu and M. A. A. Schoonen, Am. Mineral., 2000, 85, 543-556.
- 405[50] R. G. Pearson, *Inorg. Chem.*, 1988, 27, 734-740.
- 406[51] L. M. Feng, L. Q. Jiang, M. Zhu, H. B. Liu, X. Zhou and C. H. Li, J. Phys. Chem. Solids, 2008,
- **69**, 967-974.
- 408[52] R. D. Shannon, Acta. Cryst., 1976, 32, 751-757.
- 409[53] G. Kieslich, S. Suna and A. K. Cheetham, *Chem. Sci.*, 2014, 5, 4712-4715.
- 410[54] C. J. Bartel, C. Sutton, B. R. Goldsmith, R. Ouyang, C. B. Musgrave, L. M. Ghiringhelli and M.
- 411 Scheffler, *Sci. Adv.*, 2019, **5**, eaav0693.
- 412[55] W. Shockley and H. J. Queisser, J. Appl. Phys., 1961, 32, 510.
- 413[56] Y. Dang, Y. Liu, Y. Sun, D. Yuan, X. Liu, W. Lu, G. Liu, H. Xia and X. Tao, Cryst. Eng. Comm.,
- 414 2015, **17**, 665-670.
- 415[57] Pharmaceuticals and Medical Devices Agency, http://www.pmda.go.jp/files/000197758.pdf,
- 416 (accessed Feb 2018).

- 417[58] Chemicool Periodic Table, www.chemicool.com, (accessed Feb 2018).
- 418[59] C. C. Stoumpos, C. D. Malliakas and M. G. Kanatzidis, *Inorg. Chem.*, 2013, **52**, 9019-9038.
- 419[60] F. Chiarella, A. Zappettini, F. Licci, I. Borriello, G. Cantele, D. Ninno, A. Cassinese and R.
- 420 Vaglio, *Phys. Rev. B*, 2008, **77**, 045129.
- 421[61] C. Ferrara, M. Patrini, A. Pisanu, P. Quadrelli, C. Milanese, C. Tealdi and L. Malavasi, J. Mater.
- 422 *Chem. A*, 2017, **5**, 9391-9395.

### 424 Author Information

- 425 \*Corresponding author
- 426 Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to yimamura@tmu.ac.jp.

**Table 1.** Averaged  $R^2$  values for training set  $R_{\text{train}}^2$  and test set  $R_{\text{test}}^2$ , and root mean squared error

Regression model	$R_{\rm train}^2$	$R_{\text{test}}^2$	RMSE
MLR	0.46	0.36	1.11
Ridge regression	0.46	0.37	1.10
Lasso regression	0.45	0.36	1.11
SVR with linear kernel	0.43	0.34	1.12
SVR with Gaussian kernel	0.89	0.65	0.81
GPR with Gaussian kernel	0.90	0.58	0.89

429 (RMSE) in test set for each band-gap prediction model.

431 **Table 2.** Band gap predicted by machine learning  $(E_g)$ , estimated cost, Bravais lattice vector length ratios  $(|\mathbf{a}|/|\mathbf{b}|, |\mathbf{a}|/|\mathbf{c}|, \text{ and } |\mathbf{b}|/|\mathbf{c}|)$ ,

432 angles between Bravais lattice vectors ( $\alpha$ ,  $\beta$ , and  $\gamma$ ), electron effective mass  $m_e^*$ , hole effective mass  $m_h^*$ , exciton binding energy  $E_b$ , and

433 theoretical PCE of 24 most promising perovskites identified.

Perovskite	$E_{g}/eV$	Cost/\$ mol <sup>-1</sup>	a / b	a / c	b / c	α/degree	$\beta$ /degree	γ/degree	me∕a.u.	$m_{\rm h}^*$ /a.u.	$E_{\rm b}/{\rm meV}$	PCE/%
CaBaMnNbS <sub>6</sub>	2.18	194	1.91	1.91	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.55	0.62	0	13.6
$CaSrCu_2I_6$	1.81	171	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.36	0.45	10	19.1
FASnI <sub>3</sub>	1.51	122	1.96	2.00	1.02	90.0	90.0	90.1	0.84	0.10	4	22.2
KSnBr <sub>3</sub>	1.92	159	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.79	0.09	9	17.4
$K_2Sn_2Br_3I_3$	1.13	179	1.98	1.98	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.81	0.07	0	22.1
$K_2Sn_2Cl_3I_3$	1.75	167	1.98	1.98	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.98	0.13	5	19.8
KSnI <sub>3</sub>	1.14	198	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.74	0.08	2	22.1
KMASn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub>	1.99	121	1.99	2.00	1.00	90.5	90.0	90.0	0.94	0.15	33	16.4
$KMASn_2Br_3I_3\\$	1.17	141	1.98	1.98	1.00	90.2	90.3	89.9	0.97	0.13	14	22.2
KMASn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	1.16	160	2.00	1.99	1.00	90.4	90.0	90.0	0.81	0.11	9	22.2
$KNH_4Sn_2Br_6$	1.97	121	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.2	90.0	90.0	0.83	0.08	1	16.7
$KNH_4Sn_2Br_3I_3\\$	1.14	140	2.00	1.99	1.00	90.8	90.1	90.0	0.79	0.08	0	22.1
$\mathrm{KNH}_4\mathrm{Sn}_2\mathrm{I}_6$	1.12	160	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.1	90.0	90.0	0.72	0.07	0	22.0
MAFASn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	1.39	122	1.98	1.98	1.00	90.1	89.4	90.0	1.00	0.09	2	23.0
$MA_2Sn_2Br_3I_3 \\$	1.33	103	1.99	1.97	0.99	90.4	90.0	90.1	1.00	0.13	13	22.9
$MA_2Sn_2Cl_3I_3 \\$	1.96	91	1.96	1.96	1.00	89.9	89.8	90.5	0.88	0.12	11	16.8
MASnI <sub>3</sub>	1.29	122	2.00	1.98	0.99	90.3	90.0	90.0	0.78	0.15	16	22.3
NaKSn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub>	1.94	126	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.78	0.07	0	17.2

NaKSn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>3</sub> I <sub>3</sub>	2.12	135	1.99	1.99	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.86	0.18	13	14.5
NaKSn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	1.54	138	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.73	0.07	0	21.9
$Na_2Sn_2Br_3I_3$	1.48	112	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.81	0.18	22	22.3
$Na_2Sn_2Cl_3I_3$	1.92	100	1.99	1.99	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.91	0.15	8	17.4
NaSnI <sub>3</sub>	1.86	147	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.0	90.0	90.0	0.72	0.07	0	18.3
NaNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	1.22	126	2.00	2.00	1.00	90.1	90.0	90.0	1.00	0.07	0	22.3

Table 3. Formation enthalpies, direct band gap, indirect band gap, gap type, and levels of CBM and VBM relative to vacuum level of 19 novel
 perovskites identified.

Perovskite	Formation enthalpy / kJ mol <sup>-1</sup>	Direct band gap / eV	Indirect band gap / eV	Gap type	CBM level / eV	VBM level / eV
CaBaMnNbS <sub>6</sub>	-1664	0.55	0.00	Indirect	-4.63	-4.63
$CaSrCu_2I_6$	-1125	0.65	0.08	Indirect	-4.88	-4.97
KSnBr <sub>3</sub>	-610	0.70	0.70	Direct	-5.04	-5.74
$K_2 Sn_2 Br_3 I_3 \\$	-1053	0.39	0.39	Direct	-5.01	-5.40
$K_2Sn_2Cl_3I_3$	-1161	0.46	0.46	Direct	-5.31	-5.77
KSnI <sub>3</sub>	-458	0.46	0.46	Direct	-4.80	-5.26
KMASn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub>	-1158	0.95	0.95	Direct	-5.53	-6.48
$KMASn_2Br_3I_3$	-1002	0.56	0.56	Direct	-5.51	-6.08
KMASn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	-878	0.54	0.54	Direct	-5.33	-5.87
KNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub>	-1117	0.51	0.51	Direct	-5.76	-6.27
$KNH_4Sn_2Br_3I_3$	-960	0.29	0.29	Direct	-5.66	-5.95
KNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	-828	0.32	0.32	Direct	-5.45	-5.77
NaKSn <sub>2</sub> Br <sub>6</sub>	-1075	0.49	0.49	Direct	-5.23	-5.72
$NaKSn_2Br_3I_3$	-919	0.51	0.51	Direct	-5.04	-5.55
NaKSn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	-785	0.37	0.37	Direct	-4.93	-5.29
$Na_2Sn_2Br_3I_3$	-821	0.66	0.66	Direct	-5.05	-5.71
$Na_2Sn_2Cl_3I_3$	-941	0.51	0.51	Direct	-5.27	-5.78
NaSnI <sub>3</sub>	-327	0.24	0.24	Direct	-5.07	-5.32
NaNH <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>2</sub> I <sub>6</sub>	-699	0.20	0.20	Direct	-5.60	-5.80

#### 439 Figure Caption





442 Figure 1. Training and test processes for machine learning models for band gap prediction.

- 443 Percentages in figure are split ratios for each set. Random seed for (1) Random was changed every
- time in 50 iterations, and random seed for (2) Random was fixed in the iterations.

(a)



446

- 447 Figure 2. (a) Ion library for each site, and number of possible AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> compositions using the
- library. (b) Diagram of novel AA'BB'X<sub>3</sub>X'<sub>3</sub> double perovskite search scheme.