This is the accepted manuscript made available via CHORUS. The article has been published as:

**Quantum Turbulent Structure in Light**
Samuel N. Alperin, Abigail L. Grotelueschen, and Mark E. Siemens
Phys. Rev. Lett. **122**, 044301 — Published 1 February 2019
DOI: [10.1103/PhysRevLett.122.044301](http://10.1103/PhysRevLett.122.044301)
Quantum Turbulent Structure in Light

Samuel N. Alperin,* Abigail L. Grotelueschen, and Mark E. Siemens†

Department of Physics & Astronomy, University of Denver, Denver, Colorado 80210, USA

The infinite superpositions of random plane waves are known to be threaded with vortex line
singularities which form complicated tangles and obey strict topological rules. We observe that
within these structures a timelike axis appears to emerge with which we can define vortex velocities
in a useful way: with both numerical simulations and optical experiments, we show that the statistics
of these velocities match those of turbulent quantum fluids such as superfluid helium and atomic
Bose-Einstein condensates. These statistics are shown to be independent of system scale. These
results raise deep questions about the general nature of quantum chaos and the role of nonlinearity
in the structure of turbulence.

Despite far predating nearly all other open problems in
both mathematics and physics, a complete theory of fluid
turbulence remains elusive, and represents one of the
greatest open problems of either discipline [1]. Though
the problem of turbulence in classical fluids was treated
with modern sophistication by Kolmogorov in the decade
before [2, 3], it was not until 1955 that Feynman, who
called turbulence the most important unsolved problem
of classical physics [4], gave the problem a truly modern
flavor by merging it with quantum mechanics [5]. Since
then great deal of effort has gone into the study of
the properties of turbulence in quantum fluids, not only
as a way to better understand the dynamics of a general
class of complicated quantum systems, but also as
a way to understand the general problem of fluid turbu-
ence, with quantum turbulence being studied by some
as the ‘skeleton’ of ordinary turbulence† [6]. With the
more recent advance of technologies based on quantum
fluidic systems, such as in quantum simulation and com-
putation [7], the understanding of quantum turbulence
has left the realm of pure theory: a fundamental un-
derstanding of quantum turbulence has become critical
to the continued development of relevant technologies.
Many important systems behave as quantum fluids; the
turbulent dynamics of superfluid Helium, Bose Einstein
condensates, and polariton condensates are all highly sig-
nificant areas of current research [8–13].

Unlike a classical fluid, a quantum fluid is spatially co-
herent over macroscopic distances. This long range order
necessitates a singly defined phase over the field, a con-
straint which forces the quantization of phase vortices
into discrete topological charges. The nature of classical
and quantum turbulence is in this way fundamentally
different: while turbulence in classical fluids is charac-
terized by structure spanning many length scales, turbu-
lucent quantum fluids have a characteristic length scale im-
parted by vortex quantization. Still, it has only recently
been shown that there exists a fundamental difference in
the measurable statistical behavior of quantum and clas-
cical fluids: the velocity statistics of turbulent quantum
fluids differ dramatically from those of turbulent classical
fluids [14–18]. While the velocity statistics of classically
turbulent systems show near-Gaussian probability distrib-
utions [19, 20], the velocity distributions of quantum
turbulence are heavy-tailed [14–18]. To our knowledge
this stands as the only quantitative measure which defini-
tively separates quantum and classical turbulence in the
inertial subrange.

While the quantum fluids discussed so far have rep-
resented exotic states of condensed matter systems, we
suggest that any spatially coherent wave should obey the
same fundamental behavior; in this Letter we analogize
laser light to a macroscopic, room temperature quantum
fluid which supports turbulent structure. Laser light
clearly satisfies the requirement of macroscopic coher-
ence, and previous work has shown that the similarity in
governing equations can explain dynamical similarities of
few vortex systems [21]. However, it is less obvious that
light can support turbulent structure in free space, in
which there are no nonlinear interactions. The pioneer-
ing work of Nye, Berry and Dennis has revealed quali-
tative links between random optical fields and superfluid
turbulence [22–24], but others have argued that in a lin-
ear system the vortices cannot drive the dynamics of the
field and thus the only similarity is appearance [25]. This
has resulted in a widespread assumption that quantum
fluidic behavior requires many body interactions [10].

In one sense, a turbulent state is one which is char-
acterized by disorder. If we think of isotropically tur-
bulent quantum fluids found in condensed matter sys-
tems as maximally disordered solutions to their govern-
ing equations (the nonlinear Schrödinger equations), then
we should expect that if we are to find structure reminis-
cent of isotropic quantum turbulence in a linear system,
we should look at the maximally disordered solutions of
those governing equations. In the case of light, the maxi-
mally disordered solutions to the Helmholtz equation are
those which can be decomposed into a uniform distribution
of random plane waves. This so called random wave
system is well studied in the context of quantum chaos,
modeling the natural excitations of classically chaotic bil-
liard tables [26, 27], and is also known to be a good model
of monochromatic laser scatter [28].

* Now at the Department of Applied Mathematics and Theoretical
Physics, University of Cambridge, Cambridge CB3 0WA, UK
Author Email: alperin@maths.cam.ac.uk
† Author Email: mark.siemens@du.edu
We begin with the construction of the random wave. Although it is trivial to define a single plane wave with two spatial dimensions and one time (or propagation) axis, as more plane waves of different orientations are added, the phase front ceases to be confined to one well defined xy-plane. As the number of random plane waves approaches infinity, the phase front of the resulting superposition fills 3-dimensional space. It is thus nontrivial to claim that the z-axis might act as a time axis in any representation of the system. However, we find that although the time axis becomes ill defined from the perspective of constituent plane waves, the propagation axis of the random wave is timelike when viewed from the perspective of emergent vortex behavior.

The top of Fig. 1 shows the numerically simulated amplitude and phase of a transverse slice of a typical random wave. The lower panel of that figure shows the tangled paths of phase singularities. We define the transverse velocity of each vortex $i$ as the rate of change of vortex position $r_i$ as a function of $z$.

Random waves are simulated by superposing a finite number of uniformly parameterized plane waves. To propagate the random wave, each plane wave in the superposition is evolved in time. Over this time evolution, the phase singularities of the random wave move about the $xy$-plane, and are created and annihilated in pairs of opposite charge, seemingly at random. However each charge is topologically stable, and because of the constraint of a continuously well defined phase there is more structure than appears, as will become clear shortly.

We record the distribution of vortex velocities in our simulated random waves, the results of which are shown at the top of Fig. 2. This shows that the vortices in linear random waves do indeed obey the characteristic heavy tailed velocity statistics of quantum turbulence. That figure also shows fits to curves consistent with the statistics of classical fluids (dotted), atomic Bose-Einstein condensates (purple band) and superfluid Helium II (dashed). In most other works on quantum turbulent velocity statistics these curves are fit the form of $a/x^b$ for a scaling constant $a$ and tail defined by $b$, which match well at the tails of measured distributions but which are divergent and unphysical near the center [14–18]. As a more physical model we fit to the superstatistical model of Beck and Miah [29], which has been shown to match the velocity statistics of quantum fluids in both the low and high velocity regimes.

Fig. 2 shows, our optical results closely match the form of the heavy tailed velocity distributions consistent with experiments and simulations of various quantum fluids, and are inconsistent with the statistics of classical fluids, which are Gaussian (dotted) [19, 20]. Our results reveal an apparent hierarchy of statistical distributions, with fits to our data having power-law tails between $1/x^{3.8}$ and $1/x^{4.6}$, while the tails of atomic Bose-Einstein condensates have been shown to be between $1/x^{3.3}$ and $1/x^{3.6}$, and those of superfluid helium fitting well to $1/x^3$. This appear to follow from superfluid helium having a higher interaction strength than the atomic Bose-Einstein condensate, and from light having no interactions at all. Previous theories have suggested that the velocity distribution seen in superfluid Helium is the fundamental, topologically mandated distribution [14, 15], but our result suggests that the $1/x^3$ tails associated with superfluid helium are the combined result of topological constraints and other phenomena, the statistical effects of which are yet to be understood.

FIG. 1. The transverse amplitude (top left) and phase (top middle) of a typical random wave. The top right panel shows the zeros of the real (white) and imaginary (black) parts of the wave represented in the top two panels, the intersections of which occur at phase singularities, which are marked in yellow. These singularities can be tracked over the propagation of the wave, the paths of which are shown in the bottom panel. That cell is oriented such that the z axis is vertical. Each vortex line is marked in a different color, highlighting a complicated, tangle-like structure. The form of tangled vortex lines shown here appears qualitatively identical to similar plots of vortex lines in condensed matter systems [18].
tical behavior of the quantum fluid represents a topological phase of fluid flow which must be invariant under the scale-changing spatial filtration operation inherent to imaging with a simple lens.

Repeating our numerical simulations with different restrictions on the allowed range of polar angles of constituent plane waves, we observe the same characteristic statistics. This implies that the imaging of a random wave with a decreasing numerical aperture results in the observation of the same dynamical vortex structure – only with increasing characteristic length scales. Thus the form of the velocity distribution is invariant on the low-pass spatial filtration inherent to the optical imaging of high frequency structure up to a scaling constant. This allows us to implement a simple experimental confirmation of our numerical results.

We therefore proceed to discuss an experimental, macroscopic observation of the vortex velocity distribution of laser scatter. We scatter a collimated Helium-Neon (633nm) laser beam with several layers of Scotch tape, and image the amplitude and phase (see Methods) of the scatter at increasing distances from the tape. A true random wave has no spatial confinement, and thus has no divergence. To approximate the lack of divergence with a scattered Gaussian beam, we image the scattered mode near the plane of the scatterer, where the mode is at its waist.

We implement the phase shifting holography technique of Yamaguchi [31] to image both the amplitude and complete phase structure of the physical random field over a length of its propagation. Physically, this is simply a two arm interferometer in which one arm can be shifted in length by quarter wavelengths, and in which the sample is shifted along the propagation axis in steps of 0.05mm. Our imaging objective has a numerical aperture of 0.75. We analyze the resulting 3D complex image as in the numerical simulations.

Marking vortex paths as in our numerical experiments, a distribution of transverse velocities is accumulated. The results, shown at the bottom of Fig. 2, reveal that macroscopically observed laser scatter does in fact obey highly non-Gaussian velocity statistics near the surface of the scatterer, consistent with quantum turbulence. As suggested previously, the numerical aperture of our experiment is limited, and consistent with our simulations we see the same behavior as with an ideal near-field imaging apparatus, but at significantly larger length scales. Whereas the ideal optical random wave exhibits intervortex lengths on the scale of hundreds of nanometers, we observe intervortex lengths on the scale of tens of micrometers, and yet see the exact same characteristic functional form describing the velocity statistics; the velocities in the two systems differ by four orders of magnitude. Continuing to treat this system as one of a 2D sea of point particles which evolve in time, this observed nonreliance of the quantum statistics on interparticle distance tells us that in such systems the effective interactions between vortex singularities do not depend on their distance between them.

It can therefore be said that with topological constraints alone, a completely linear system can be forced to exhibit the emergence of structure typically associated with nonlinear interactions; in condensed matter systems it is understood that it is the nonlinear, particle-like attractions and repulsions of topological charges which create the high velocity creation/annihilation events that cause the heavy-tailed statistics characteristic of quantum turbulence. That these statistics appear in a linear medium is surprising, and raises important questions, as it is not clear what it means for a linear system to possess the characteristic structure of turbulence.

We note that the details of topologically mediated particle-like interactions between vortices in quantum fluids are themselves not yet fully understood. What is clear...
from our results, however, is that their underlying physics is surprisingly universal, being observed in very different physical systems governed by very different equations.

More generally, we have provided evidence that ordinary laser light can be thought of as a quantum fluid in a useful way, demonstrating that classical optics and quantum fluid dynamics are intimately tied. This raises the question of what other quantum fluid dynamical behavior can be understood with linear wave mechanics. While in this work insight was gained into the fluid dynamics of condensed matter systems with optical analogues, we expect this type of analysis to be fruitful in the other direction as well. In particular, we expect that the structure of vortex nucleations, such as is seen in the fluid dynamical von Kármán effect [32], will soon inspire the study of new optical phenomena, and bring insight to visually similar and perhaps dynamically analogous optical structures such as the fractional vortex Hilbert’s hotel [33]. In short, it seems that members of both fields have much more to learn from each other than previously realized.

We thank Geoffrey Diederich for helpful experimental advice, and thank Mark Lusk for enlightening discussions and for commenting in detail on our manuscript. The authors acknowledge financial support from the National Science Foundation (1509733,1553905).