Circuit-QED-based measurement of vortex lattice order in a Josephson junction array
R. Cosmic, Hiroki Ikegami, Zhirong Lin, Kunihiro Inomata, Jacob M. Taylor, and Yasunobu Nakamura
Phys. Rev. B 98, 060501 — Published 21 August 2018
DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.98.060501
Circuit QED-based measurement of vortex lattice order in a Josephson junction array

R. Cosmic,1,2, † Hiroki Ikegami,1, † Zhirong Lin,1 Kunihiro Inomata,1,3 Jacob M. Taylor,4,5,2 and Yasunobu Nakamura1,2, †
1 Center for Emergent Matter Science (CEMS), RIKEN, Wako, Saitama 351-0198, Japan
2 Research Center for Advanced Science and Technology (RCAST), The University of Tokyo, Meguro-ku, Tokyo 153-8904, Japan
3 National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology (AIST), Tsukuba, Ibaraki 305-8563, Japan
4 Joint Center for Quantum Information and Computer Science (QuICS), University of Maryland, College Park, Maryland 20742, USA
5 Joint Quantum Institute (JQI), National Institute of Standards and Technology, Gaithersburg, Maryland 20899, USA
(Dated: August 1, 2018)

Superconductivity provides a canonical example of a quantum phase of matter. When superconducting islands are connected by Josephson junctions in a lattice, the low temperature state of the system can map to the celebrated XY model and its associated universality classes. This has been used to experimentally implement realizations of Mott insulator and Berezinskii–Kosterlitz–Thouless (BKT) transitions to vortex dynamics analogous to those in type-II superconductors. When an external magnetic field is added, the effective spins of the XY model become frustrated, leading to the formation of topological defects (vortices). Here we observe the many-body dynamics of such an array, including frustration, via its coupling to a superconducting microwave cavity. We take the design of the transmon qubit, but replace the single junction between two antenna pads with the complete array. This allows us to probe the system at 10 mK with minimal self-heating by using weak coherent states at the single (microwave) photon level to probe the resonance frequency of the cavity. We observe signatures of ordered vortex lattice at rational flux fillings of the array.

One of the central issues in modern physics is to elucidate the behavior of many-body systems. They are ubiquitous in nature, but our understanding is far from comprehensive because of difficulties in analytical and numerical calculations, especially for systems with frustration or those that exhibit the sign problem. Soon after the concept of a controlled quantum system to emulate a less-understood system was suggested1, several groups around the world began investigation of Josephson junction arrays (JJAs) formed in fabricated superconducting lattice structures as a way to explore ordered quantum matter2–15. More recently, the ability to control individual elements has enabled a proliferation of quantum simulation approaches16–18 as demonstrated with ultracold neutral atoms19,20, arrays of atomic ions21, electrons in semiconductors22, and superconducting circuits23.

Here we show how the architecture of circuit quantum electrodynamics (cQED), so successful for qubit experiments, enables new observations of JJA-based many-body physics. Our system consists of a regular network of small superconducting islands coupled to each other via Josephson junctions [see Fig. 1(a)]2,3. Interesting many-body phenomena are expected as a result of competition between the Josephson energy $E_J$ associated with the tunneling of Cooper pairs and the charging energy $E_C = e^2/(2C_J)$ describing the Coulomb blockade. ($C_J$ is the capacitance between neighboring islands and $e$ is elemental charge.) Indeed, low-frequency (DC) transport measurements have revealed that JJAs show a quantum phase transition between a superconducting and an insulating phases6–8,10,12,13 and a commensurate-incommensurate transition of vortices in response to frustration induced by uniform external magnetic fields9,11,24.

Circuit QED (cQED), a circuit implementation of a cavity QED, offers a novel approach to address such problems. It is a technique that has developed in the field of quantum information processing with superconducting qubits 25–27, where the strong coupling between an isolated dipole—typically a qubit—and cavity microwave photons allows for direct investigations of the dynamics of a qubit at the single-photon level. Applying this technique to the dynamics of many-body systems built from JJAs, we can investigate the ground states of JJAs with a weak perturbation of a single-photon level and directly detect dynamics of individual excitations. At the same time, we can avoid the self-heating from vortex induced phase slips. In this Letter, we report a cQED investigation of a JJA. Specifically, we observe the formation of lattice orderings of vortices via the response of the cavity. We find that the dynamics of the linearized response of the JJA—the plasma modes—leads to a strong shift of the cavity frequency in a manner that enables identification of ordered phases even with moderate disorder. These experiments represent a first step towards quantum many-body investigations, as we focus on the ‘classical’ regime where the Josephson energy is larger than the charging energy of individual islands, i.e., $E_J/E_C \approx 2$.

We use a JJA with a square network of superconducting islands arranged in a quasi-1D geometry of the length $L$ of 30 plaquettes and the width $W$ of 3 plaquettes (the area enclosed by one plaquette, $S$, is $6 \times 6 \mu m^2$), made of Al films evaporated on a silicon substrate. The JJA has $E_J/h = 25.8 \pm 0.2$ GHz estimated from the re-
using the circuit QED architecture. The JJA consisting of

![Image](70x590 to 155x654)

FIG. 1. (a) Schematic illustration of investigation of a JJA using the circuit QED architecture. The JJA consisting of 30x3 plaquettes connected to the two pads is mounted in a 3D microwave cavity. Response of the cavity is investigated by microwave reflection through the port. (b) Left: optical image of a JJA connected to the pads. Right: scanning electron microscope (SEM) image showing individual islands (false colored). Note the proximity along the lower left to upper right diagonal leads to additional capacitance, as discussed in the text. (c) Typical resonance spectra of the TE_{101} cavity mode for two different flux values. Φ/Φ_0 is the normalized flux threading each plaquette.

pads connected to the JJA extending in the direction of the electric field of the TE_{101} mode. The pads provide a large electric dipole moment, allowing for a coupling strength of g/2π ≈ 100 MHz. We measure the cavity’s complex reflection coefficient S_{11}, see [Fig. 1(c)]. Photons enter and exit the cavity through the input port at a rate κ_{ext}/2π ≈ 1.5 MHz. The cavity containing the JJA is cooled down to ≈ 10 mK with a dilution refrigerator.

In order to study the frustration-induced properties of the JJA, we apply a magnetic field B normal to the JJA plane using a coil. Figure 2(a) shows |S_{11}| for the JJA as a function of magnetic field and probe frequency. Here the magnetic field is expressed by the frustration parameter: a normalized flux per plaquette Φ/Φ_0, where Φ = SB is a flux threading in a plaquette and Φ_0 = h/2e is flux quantum (h is Planck’s constant). The spectrum shown in the figure is symmetric around Φ/Φ_0 = 1/2 as expected, and exhibits structure near the fractional values of Φ/Φ_0 of 0, 1/9, 1/6, 1/3, 1/2, · · ·, as well as additional fine structure at non-fractional values of Φ/Φ_0. We note those structures corresponds to individual flux insertions. We also remark that the commensurate values listed above provide features also at 100 mK.

To understand the features observed, we consider the dual theory of the array, where we use vortices as our “particle” rather than Cooper pairs. Specifically, in a uniform magnetic field, vortices have a chemical potential and are induced with a density of Φ/Φ_0. These vortices behave as particles with long-range interactions in a periodic potential made by the JJA pattern. The vortices tunnel from site to site with a rate that scales with E_C and they interact strongly with a repulsive potential characterized by E_J. Our JJA with E_J/E_C ≈ 2 ≫ 2/π^{3/2} suggests the predominance of the repulsive interaction, which allows for formation of vortex lattices commensurate with the underlying pattern of the JJA at the fractional Φ/Φ_0 as a result of the repulsion between vortices and the commensurability effect by the JJA pattern. The large shifts in the dip in reflection observed at around the fractional values of Φ/Φ_0 in Fig. 2(a) is one piece of evidence for such vortex-lattice formations.

To confirm the formation of vortex lattices, we numerically calculate the classical ground state of our problem, and capacitive terms are treated perturbatively in order to find the semi-classical response of the system. The Hamiltonian of the JJA is given by

\[ H_{\text{JJA}} = \frac{(2e)^2}{2} \sum_{\langle i,j \rangle} n_i C_{ij}^{-1} n_j - E_J \sum_{\langle i,j \rangle} \cos(\phi_i - \phi_j - A_{ij}), \]

(1)

where \( n_i \) is the number of Cooper pairs and \( \phi_i \) is a phase of the order parameter of the \( i \)-th island, satisfying the commutation relation \[ [\phi_j, n_k] = i\delta_{jk} \]. The first term in Eq.(1) represents the charging energy and the second term describes the Josephson effect, where \( C_{ij} \) is an element of a capacitance matrix \( C \) composed of \( C_J, C_S \), and \( C_g \) and \( A_{ij} = (2\pi/\Phi_0) \int_{S_i} \mathbf{A} \cdot d\mathbf{l} \) is the line integral of
The spectra are taken at 10 mK and at a power of $P_{MW} = -132$ dBm ($6.3 \times 10^{-17}$ W) at the input port of the cavity, which corresponds to the average number of intracavity photons of 2.4. The cyan zones of the flux bias are magnified in Figs. 3(a) and (d). (b) Theoretical calculation of $|S_{11}|$ based upon the linear response theory of assuming fixed vortex configurations and no fitting parameters. (c) Plasma modes of the JJA as a function of $\Phi/\Phi_0$. Proximity of a plasma mode to the cavity frequency leads to the strong dispersive shift seen in (a). The horizontal dashed line indicates the bare cavity frequency.

Once the vortex configurations of the ground states are known, the frequency of non-topological excitations $\omega_i$ can be evaluated in the presence of small $E_C$ ($\ll E_J$). These excitations are plasma modes in the JJA or spin-wave modes in the language of the XY model. They are collective oscillations of $\vec{\phi}$ around $\vec{\phi}^{(0)}$ due to kinetic fluctuations in $\vec{\phi}$ associated with the charging energy. The mode frequencies are calculated by expanding $V_J(\vec{\phi})$ to second order

$$V_J(\vec{\phi}) = V_J(\vec{\phi}^{(0)}) + \frac{h_{ij}}{2}(\phi_i - \phi_i^{(0)})(\phi_j - \phi_j^{(0)})$$

with $h_{ij} = \frac{\partial^2 V_J(\vec{\phi})}{\partial \phi_i \partial \phi_j} |_{\vec{\phi}^{(0)}}$ and combining with the charging energy described in terms of $C$. Then, a set of $\omega_i^2$ are given as eigenvalues of $(\frac{2}{\Phi_0})^2 hC^{-1}$, where $h$ is a matrix having elements $h_{ij}$. Note that $[(\frac{2}{\Phi_0})^2 h]^{-1}$ can be regarded as an effective inductance matrix $L$ of the JJA (see Supplemental Materials for details).

For our regime of large $E_J/E_C$ — the classical regime, the spin waves correspond entirely to the response of a network of inductors and capacitors, and thus are not chiral. The corrections to this behavior arise from voltage-induced twisted boundary conditions for the flux variables, exactly the effects that are exponentially suppressed in our transmon-like design. We anticipate that reducing $E_J/E_C$ will lead to chiral effects in systems like ours.

The calculated spectra of the plasma modes are shown in Fig. 2(c). There are 63 modes in our JJA with $30 \times 3$ plaquettes for a given vortex configuration. The spectra steeply move and exhibit many discontinuous jumps with increasing $\Phi/\Phi_0$. The jumps are due to changes in the configuration of vortices induced by injections of the vector potential $A$ from an island $i$ to an island $j$. To find the ground state vortex configuration, i.e., the lowest classical-energy stable configuration of phases $\vec{\phi}^{(0)}$, we neglect any charging effect and numerically minimize the Josephson term $V_J(\vec{\phi}) = -E_J \sum_{(i,j)} \cos(\phi_i - \phi_j - A_{ij})$ at a given $\Phi/\Phi_0$. [Here $\vec{\phi} = (\phi_1, \ldots, \phi_n)^T$.] Note that, in this approximation, Eq. (1) reduces to the classical XY-spin model with a tunable frustration by $A_{ij}$ and vortices correspond to classical ones. The obtained vortex configurations are identified by calculating the circulating current around each plaquette [cf. Figs. 3(a)(iv) and (b)(ii)] and show a periodic arrangement at fractional values of $\Phi/\Phi_0$. These periodic structures are stabilized to avoid the energy cost due to the vortex-vortex repulsion and the vortex-edge repulsion.$^9,11$.
The port is formulated by the input-output relation. The coupling of the cavity photons to the input pads. The following assumptions: (i) The plasma modes coupled to the cavity photons via a dipole charge induced on the pads. (ii) The coupling of the cavity photons to the input port is formulated by the input-output relation. (iii) A small amount of ohmic loss in the Josephson junctions associated with the tunneling of quasiparticles is included. (See Supplemental Material for details of the theoretical analysis.) The calculated cavity response is compared with the experimental data in Fig. 2. We show there is a reasonable correspondence between them, especially a large frequency shift over a finite range of $\Phi/\Phi_0$ at around the fractional values of $\Phi/\Phi_0$.

We note that for regions where the lowest frequency spin-wave modes are dense and rapidly moving with flux, i.e., the incommensurate regions, we see poor qualitative agreement between the input-output theory and the experiment. We interpret this as due to a natural consequence of the 5% disorder in the array (see the Supplemental Material for realizations of the theoretical spectra with different disorder); the need to include the quantum dynamics of the vortices, which are here entirely neglected; and the lack of inclusion of finite temperature corrections, where the system may be in a different, metastable vortex configuration some or all of the time. On the other hand, the ordered phases at the commensurate flux bias points are not affected even in the presence of the 5% disorder since these configurations are energetically stable (see the Supplemental Material).

At half vortex filling ($\Phi_0/\Phi_0 = 1/2$), we can plot the current around each plaquette from the theoretical calculation as shown in Fig. 3(c). Vortices are seen as peaks in circulation around individual plaquettes, and form a checkerboard. If we introduce one defect (by raising or lowering the magnetic field to create a vortex or antivortex, respectively), we see in the spin-wave response and in the reflection of the experiment a cusp at the insertion point of either a vortex or anti-vortex [see Figs. 3(a) and (b)]. However, one defect does not destroy the band gap observed in the spin-wave spectrum, which can be understood as a finite-size effect in the induced robustness of the checkerboard phase. Eventually, here around three anti-vortices, the spin wave spectrum begins to collapse and we observe a dramatic change in the cavity response, consistent with our qualitative interpretation of the destruction of rigidity in the vortex crystal. In principle, this rigidity is briefly recovered as we approach 4/9, which is again ordered, but has much lower fundamental frequency and is not as robust to single vortex subtraction.

Another key ordering occurs at 1/6 shown in Fig. 3(f), where we have alternating columns of empty columns and columns with one vortex in the middle. This is a quasi-1D phase, which with one anti-vortex added has appreciable compressibility. However, with one vortex added, we see the onset of zig-zag ordering and expect these zig-zag excitations of a pair of vortices pushed towards the pads to have much smaller kinetic fluctuations than individual vortices. This persists down to 1/5 filling, where the addition of one more vortex leads to a compressible regime again [see Figs. 3(d) and (e)].

In conclusion, we have shown that cQED-based probing allows for the observation of low temperature phases of an engineered many-body superconducting system. While the present work has operated in the large capacitance regime, which suppresses the quantum dynamics
of the vortices, future work should be able to investigate a wider range of parameters and address key questions about the transition from vortex ordering to Cooper-pair hopping in a magnetic field\textsuperscript{3}. This is particularly intriguing as, at low offset-charge disorder, the case of charged bosons with long-range interactions in a magnetic field naturally leads to fractional quantum Hall states\textsuperscript{35}. Our approach may provide a framework for enabling such experiments.

We acknowledge M. Marthaler, J. Cole, N. T. Phuc, V. Sudhir, S. Furukawa, C. Lobb, and H. Mooij for fruitful discussions. JMT thanks the RIKEN team for their kind hospitality during his stays. This work was partly supported by ImPACT Program of Council for Science, Technology and Innovation and the NSF-funded Physics Frontier Center at the Joint Quantum Institute.

\textsuperscript{*} cosmic@qc.rcast.u-tokyo.ac.jp
\textsuperscript{†} hikegami@riken.jp
\textsuperscript{‡} yasuobu@ap.t.u-tokyo.ac.jp