This is the accepted manuscript made available via CHORUS. The article has been published as:

Coulomb and electron-phonon interactions in metals
Igor S. Tupitsyn, Andrey S. Mishchenko, Naoto Nagaosa, and Nikolay Prokof'ev
Phys. Rev. B 94, 155145 — Published 27 October 2016
DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.94.155145
Coulomb and electron-phonon interactions in metals

Igor S. Tupitsyn,1,2 Andrey S. Mishchenko,3,2 Naoto Nagaosa,3,4 and Nikolay Prokof’ev1,2,5

1Department of Physics, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA 01003, USA
2Russian Research Center “Kurchatov Institute”, 123182 Moscow, Russia
3Cross-Correlated Materials Research Group, RIKEN Advanced Science Institute (ASI), Wako 351-0198, Japan
4Department of Applied Physics, The University of Tokyo, 7-3-1 Hongo, Bunkyo-ku, Tokyo 113, Japan
5Department of Theoretical Physics, The Royal Institute of Technology, Stockholm SE-10691 Sweden

(Dated: October 3, 2016)

An accurate and consistent theory of phonons in metals requires that all long-range Coulomb interactions between charged particles (electrons and ions) be treated on equal footing. So far, all attempts to deal with this non-perturbative system were relying on uncontrolled approximations in the absence of small parameters. In this work, we develop the Diagrammatic Monte Carlo approach for a two-component Coulomb system that obtains the solution to this fundamental problem in an approximation free way by computing vertex corrections from higher-order skeleton graphs. The feasibility of the method is demonstrated by calculating the spectrum of longitudinal acoustic phonons in a simple cubic lattice, determining their sound velocity, and obtaining the phonon spectral densities by analytic continuation of the Matsubara Green’s functions. Final results are checked against the lowest-order fully self-consistent GW-approximation in both adiabatic and non-adiabatic regimes.

PACS numbers: 71.38.-k,31.15.A-,71.38.Mx

Standard theory of electron-phonon interaction (EPI) in metals involves a number of approximations. While some of them are based on the small adiabatic parameter $\gamma = \omega_D/\epsilon_F \sim \sqrt{m/M} \ll 1$ (where $\omega_D$ is the Debye frequency, $\epsilon_F$ is the Fermi energy, $m$ and $M$ are the electron and ion masses, respectively), other approximations, such as neglecting (i) vertex corrections based on the effective electron-electron interaction and (ii) the mutual self-consistent feedback between the phonon and electron subsystems, remain uncontrolled. Both effects do not involve small parameters because EPI in metals is inseparable from strong Coulomb forces between the electrons. Indeed, at the level of the bare Hamiltonian, unscreened Coulomb ion-ion interactions prevent formation of longitudinal acoustic phonons by shifting their frequencies all the way up to the frequency of ionic plasma oscillations, $\omega_p = q\sqrt{4\pi\epsilon^2/q_0\epsilon_{\infty}}(n_e/M) = \sqrt{4\pi n_e e^2/M\epsilon_{\infty}}$, where $n_e = n_i$ is the conduction electron/ion charge density and $\epsilon_{\infty}$ is the ion-core dielectric constant. Once both the long-range electron-phonon and electron-electron interactions are accounted for, the acoustic spectrum is recovered back due to screening1; the underlying mechanism can be illustrated by replacing $4\pi\epsilon^2/q_0^2$ with $4\pi\epsilon^2/(q_0^2 + \kappa^2)$ (where $\kappa$ is the Thomas-Fermi wavevector) in the phonon spectrum to get $\omega(q \rightarrow 0) \rightarrow \omega_p(q/\kappa)$.

In the adiabatic approximation it is assumed that interactions between (and with) the heavy ions are screened by the static dielectric function of a metal and the phonon spectrum is determined from the corresponding dynamic matrix of a solid. Thus transformed crystal vibrations and EPI are no longer singular at small momenta. When further progress is made by separating effects of electron-electron and electron-phonon interactions2,3, double-counting is dealt with by excluding static electronic polarization terms from the renormalization of phonon propagators, and vertex corrections based on EPI are neglected because they are small in $\gamma$. The adiabatic approximation breaks down when $\gamma \gtrsim 1$ is considered, for instance, to explain enhancement of the critical temperature in phonon-mediated superconductors4–6.

However, regardless of the $\gamma$ parameter value, EPI does not involve natural small parameters in metals and remains strong. This means that even the first step in the adiabatic approximation (screening of long-range interactions) is ill-defined since the static dielectric function itself should be the outcome of the non-perturbative calculation based on all relevant interactions, including EPI. The importance of vertex corrections was studied by various groups in connection with superconducting7–10 and Dirac11 materials, as well as for polarons12,13, but never for a two-component Coulomb system in a systematic way when all forces are treated on an equal footing, and all uncertainties are quantified.

In this work, we develop the bold-line Diagrammatic Monte Carlo (BDMC) technique that allows us to deal with Coulomb interactions in a fully self-consistent, approximations free, manner and obtain final results with controlled accuracy by accounting for vertex corrections from higher-order skeleton diagrams. We demonstrate that BDMC leads to a theory capable of solving the fundamental problem of the phonon spectrum in a metal at any $\gamma$, including the most difficult regime of $\gamma \sim 1$, i.e. when there are no small parameters of any kind.

Our model simulation considers a simple cubic lattice of vibrating ions coupled to conduction electrons, and aims at computing the spectrum of longitudinal phonons and their velocity of sound in the thermodynamic limit. We also perform spectral analysis of the phonon Matsubara Green’s function in the most difficult parameter regime $\gamma \sim 1$. We show that vertex corrections to the
lowest-order (GW) approximation significantly soften the sound velocity at $\gamma \gtrsim 1$, and reduce the amplitude of the giant Kohn anomaly at small $\gamma$. As far as we know, this kind of studies were not possible to perform in the past; none of the previous work for Coulomb systems was done at the level of high-order skeleton technique in the absence of small parameters.

System. We consider a lattice model of a metal defined by the Hamiltonian

$$H = H_{FH} + H_c + H_{ph} + H_{el-ph},$$

(1)

where $H_{FH}$ is the standard Fermi-Hubbard model parameterized by the n.n. hopping amplitude $t$ (with the tight-binding dispersion relation $\epsilon(k)$), the on-site repulsion $U$, and the chemical potential $\mu$. In what follows we use the lattice constant $a$ and hopping $t$ as units of length and energy, respectively.

The second term describes Coulomb-electron-electron interaction, $H_e = \sum_{i,j,\sigma}\nu_{i\sigma}V_e(r_{ij})\nu_{j\sigma}$, where $\nu_{i\sigma} = a^{\dagger}_{i\sigma}a_{i\sigma}$ is the electron density operator for the spin component $\sigma = \uparrow, \downarrow$ on site i (we employ standard second-quantization notations for creation and annihilation operators), and $V_e(r_{ij}) = U_c/[i-j]$; in Fourier space, $V_e(q \to 0) = 4\pi U_c/q^2$. We consider $U_c = e^2/\epsilon\infty$ as an independent (from $U$) parameter; the bare electron-electron interaction is defined as the sum of local (spin-dependent) and non-local terms: $V_{ee}(r_{ij}) = U\delta_{ij} + V_{ee}(r_{ij})$ (for brevity, we do not explicitly mention the tensor structure of interactions, propagators, and irreducible objects in the spin space).

The Hamiltonian of ionic system is assumed to be harmonic and described by a collection of longitudinal phonons $H_{ph} = \sum_q \omega(q)b^{\dagger}_q b_q$. Their bare spectrum is $\omega(q \to 0) = \omega_p$.

The electron-ion interaction has the standard density-displacement form,

$$H_{el-ph} = \sum_{q,k,\sigma} M(q) a^{\dagger}_{q+k,\sigma} a_{q,\sigma} (b_k + b^{\dagger}_{-k}),$$

(2)

with the interaction vertex $M(q)$ based on the derivative of the Coulomb electron-ion potential. This interaction type is dominant within the tight-binding model used for $H_{FH}$. Since in all expressions we always have to deal with $|M(q)|^2$ it makes sense to introduce $V_{ep}(q) = |M(q)|^2$. An explicit expression for the EPI used in this work has the form $V_{ep}(q) = [\omega_p^2/2\omega(q)] V_{ee}(q)$. The technique, presented in this work (see Methodology), can work with arbitrary type of EPI and momentum dependence of the bare phonon spectrum $\omega(q)$. Solely for the purpose of minimizing the number of model parameters and transparency of presentation, we confine ourselves to a specific choice of $\omega(q) = \omega_p$ with $\omega_p/t = 0.5$. The asymptotic form of $V_{ep}(q \to 0) = [\omega_p^2/2\omega(q)$ is unambiguously fixed by the electro-neutrality of the system.

Methodology. Our calculations are based on the so-called $G^2W$-expansion, see Fig.1(a), when reducible (with respect to cutting one line) diagrams for self-energy $\Sigma$ and polarization $\Pi$ are expressed in terms of fully-dressed Green’s functions, $G$, and screened effective interactions, $W$, defined self-consistently through Dyson equations in the Matsubara frequency-momentum space:

$$G^{-1} = G^{-1}_{0} - \Sigma, \quad W^{-1} = \bar{V}^{-1} - \Pi. \quad (3)$$

Here $G^{-1}_{0} = i\omega_n + \mu - \epsilon(k)$ and $D^{-1}_{0} = [\omega_m^2 + \omega^2(q)]/2\omega(q)$, are the bare electron and phonon Green’s functions, respectively. Their Matsubara frequencies are defined differently: for fermions, $\omega_n = 2\pi T(n + 1/2)$ with integer $n$; for bosons, $\omega_m = 2\pi T m$ with integer $m$. Within the $G^2W$-expansion framework, one has to combine the bare electron-electron potential with the phonon-mediated term to form the frequency-dependent potential $\bar{V} = V_{ee} - D_{0}V_{ep}$ appearing in the second Dyson equation. This formulation is complete in a sense that exponential convergence of the skeleton sequences with increasing the diagram order leads to the final solution of the problem.

To determine properties of the phonon subsystem, we define the polarization function irreducible with respect to cutting one phonon line, $\Pi^{-1}_{p} = \Pi^{-1} - V_{ee}$. By construction, in combination with $V_{ep}$, it plays the role of self-energy for the renormalized phonon propagator

$$D^{-1} = D^{-1}_{0} - \Sigma_{ph}; \quad \Sigma_{ph} = -V_{ep}\Pi_{p}. \quad (4)$$

Our implementation of the BDGMC technique is closely following that described in Ref.16. We sample the configuration space of skeleton free-energy diagrams in the $(r, \tau)$-representation$^{17}$ with one of the lines always being marked (by red cross in Fig.1(b-c)) as “measuring”; its functional dependence on space-time coordinates of its end-points is arbitrary. When the “measuring line” is removed, the remaining diagram contributes either to $\Pi$, see Fig.1(b), or to $\Sigma$, see Fig.1(c). In the imaginary-time representation, we need to split $W$ into the sum of the bare electron-electron potential, $V_{ee}(r_{ij})\delta(\tau_1 - \tau_2)$, and the rest, $W - V_{ee}(r_{ij})\delta(\tau_1 - \tau_2)$, because $\delta$-functional and generic functional dependencies on time are incompatible. This implies, in particular, that the measuring line cannot be of the $V_{ee}$-type.
Both $\Sigma$ and $\Pi$ are computed as sums of skeleton graphs, up to order $N$ (there are $2N$ vertexes in the $N$-th order graph); we will denote these sums as $\Sigma_N$ and $\Pi_N$. The lowest-order contributions are known right away because they are nothing but products of $G$ and $W$ functions; in the skeleton formulation, $\Sigma_1$ and $\Pi_1$ are equivalent to the GW-approximation with fully self-consistent treatment of the EPI feedback on polarization. By charge neutrality, Hartree terms involving $V_x(r \neq 0)$ have to be removed. Thus, Monte Carlo statistics has to be collected only from higher-order diagrams and then added to the GW-result. The self-consistency loop is closed after $\Sigma$ and $\Pi$ are used in Dyson equations to define new $G$ and $W$ functions that are subsequently considered in all diagrams as the simulation continues. To solve Dyson equations (3-4) we employ Fast-Fourier-Transform algorithms to go to the momentum-frequency space where these equations are algebraic.

The largest system size simulated in this work was $L^3 = 64^3$, with periodic boundary conditions. The thermodynamic limit was recovered by extrapolating results obtained for $L = 16, 32$, and $64$ to infinity. We also have to perform an extrapolation to the $N \to \infty$ limit, or observe good convergence of results with increasing $N$. In two panels of Fig.2 we plot local polarization $\Pi(r = 0, \tau)$ and self-energy $\Sigma(r = 0, \tau)$ along with their partial order-by-order contributions. Clearly, contributions from the third-order skeleton graphs are already very small, but understanding their role is required for estimating accuracy limits of calculations truncated at $N = 2$.

**Results.** The tight-binding model on a simple cubic lattice at half-filling satisfies the “nesting” condition at momentum $Q_N = (\pi, \pi, \pi)$. This leads to singularity in the density of states, logarithmic divergence of polarization at zero temperature, $\Pi(q \to Q_N) \sim \ln|q - Q_N|$, and the corresponding “giant” Kohn anomaly in the phonon spectrum (typical for one-dimensional systems). It is expected then that at low temperature the phonon spectrum is anomalously soft at $Q_N$ and there is a structural phase transition with the dominant density modulation at $Q_N$. In contrast, the conventional Kohn anomaly is linked to the logarithmic divergence of the polarization derivative $\partial\Pi/\partial q$ at momentum transfer $q = 2k_F$ (at $T = 0$).

**FIG. 3:** Giant Kohn anomaly in the renormalized phonon spectrum $\Omega(q)$ at the nesting vector $Q_N = (\pi, \pi, \pi)$ for $L = 32$, $n_c = 1$, and $N = 2$. In the inset we show how $\Omega(q)$ at $T = 0.1$ depends on the diagram order: GW-approximation (magenta), $N = 2$ (blue).

**FIG. 4:** Giant Kohn anomaly at the nesting vector $Q_N$ in the GW approximation for $L = 32$ and $n_c = 1$. In the inset we show how $\Omega(Q_N)$ approaches zero with temperature.

In Fig. 3 we show the dramatic temperature dependence of the renormalized phonon dispersion $\Omega(q)$ (along the (111) direction) at half-filling. The spectrum was deduced from the pole-approximation $D^{-1} \propto \omega^2 - \Omega^2(q)$ for the phonon propagator, see Eqs.(4). As temperature decreases, the cusp at $Q_N$ is getting more pronounced and the phonon spectrum softens; temperature scales (and appropriate system sizes) required for studying the structural transition point are exponentially small (large) in this case. Vertex corrections substantially reduce the amplitude of the Giant Kohn anomaly, see inset in Fig. 3,
but do not eliminate it. Within the GW-approximation, see Fig. 4, the cusp at $Q_N$ touches zero at $T_c \approx 0.035$ (for parameters of Fig. 4) indicating the above mentioned structural phase transition.

Away from half-filling, the phonon spectrum should demonstrate the standard Kohn anomaly at $q = 2k_F$ smeared by finite-temperature effects. It can be seen as a small wiggle on the phonon dispersion curve corresponding to density $n_c = 0.7$ in the momentum interval $4.5 < q < 5$ (at this filling factor, $k_F \approx 2.4$ along the (111) direction), see the main plot in Fig. 5.

As far as screening effects are concerned, the plasmon gap at $q \to 0$ is closed at all densities, and $\Omega(q \to 0)$ clearly demonstrates the characteristic sound-wave dependence $c_s q$, see Figs. 3-5. When $n_c$ decreases (at constant $U_c$ and $\omega_p$) this implies that ions are getting lighter, $M = (4\pi U_c/\omega_p^2) n_c$ the spectrum at large values of $q > 2k_F$ saturates at $\omega_p$, see the main panel in Fig. 5, and the sound velocity increases, see Fig. 5 inset. This behavior is in complete agreement with the Fermi-liquid theory prediction $c_s \propto (k_F/m) \sqrt{m/M} \propto n_c^{-1/6}$ at constant plasma frequency.

Near half-filling, $0.5 < n_c < 1$, where the adiabatic parameter is small, $\gamma \lesssim 0.1$, the effect of higher-order vertex corrections on sound velocity appears to be small, and phonon spectra at small momenta are indistinguishable within the error bars (this is not the case for large momenta, especially at $Q_N$, see the inset in Fig. 3). As expected, higher-order diagrams start playing a role at low density when the adiabatic parameter is approaching unity. In the inset of Fig. 5 we show how the sound velocity depends on $\gamma$ and how strong the effect of vertex corrections is. At densities $n_c \lesssim 0.2$ (or $\gamma \gtrsim 0.2$) the GW-approximation becomes rather unsatisfactory.

To gain additional information on dynamic properties of phonons, we perform analytic continuation of the Matsubara Green’s function $D(q, \tau)$ (with $\Pi(q = 0, \omega_m) \propto \delta_{\omega,0}$ obeying the particle conservation law requirement) into the real frequency domain. This is done by a combination of the unbiased stochastic optimization and consistent constraints methods. In Fig. 6 we show the phonon spectral function for several values of momenta along the (111) direction at $T = \omega_p/2 = 0.25t$, and compare GW with $N = 2$ results. This is done in the most difficult low-density limit $n_c = 0.025$ where $\gamma \sim 1$. Note the large width of phonon peaks that is often comparable to their energies. Strong damping of longitudinal phonons is an inevitable property accompanying screening of long range interactions, which has been observed in metals since early neutron scattering experiments. First, the phonon damping is increasing with $q$ at small momenta, but then the phonon lines are getting more narrow at larger values of $q$ as the phonon life-time is becoming longer. For the three largest values of $q > 2k_F$, the phonon energy (first moment of the spectral function) saturates at $\omega_p$, in accordance with Fig. 5.

As far as screening effects are concerned, the plasmon gap at $q \to 0$ is closed at all densities, and $\Omega(q \to 0)$ clearly demonstrates the characteristic sound-wave dependence $c_s q$, see Figs. 3-5. When $n_c$ decreases (at constant $U_c$ and $\omega_p$) this implies that ions are getting lighter, $M = (4\pi U_c/\omega_p^2) n_c$ the spectrum at large values of $q > 2k_F$ saturates at $\omega_p$, see the main panel in Fig. 5, and the sound velocity increases, see Fig. 5 inset. This behavior is in complete agreement with the Fermi-liquid theory prediction $c_s \propto (k_F/m) \sqrt{m/M} \propto n_c^{-1/6}$ at constant plasma frequency.

Near half-filling, $0.5 < n_c < 1$, where the adiabatic parameter is small, $\gamma \lesssim 0.1$, the effect of higher-order vertex corrections on sound velocity appears to be small, and phonon spectra at small momenta are indistinguishable within the error bars (this is not the case for large momenta, especially at $Q_N$, see the inset in Fig. 3). As expected, higher-order diagrams start playing a role at low density when the adiabatic parameter is approaching unity. In the inset of Fig. 5 we show how the sound velocity depends on $\gamma$ and how strong the effect of vertex corrections is. At densities $n_c \lesssim 0.2$ (or $\gamma \gtrsim 0.2$) the GW-approximation becomes rather unsatisfactory.
calculations of the renormalized phonon spectrum and sound velocity for all values of $\gamma$. In this work we focused on basic principles and discussed only the longitudinal acoustic phonons; including other phonon branches is left for future work but we do not see any difficulty in this regard. One may also quantify the feedback of the phonon subsystem on electronic properties (spectrum, dielectric function, optical conductivity, effective interactions, etc.) and aim at computing the irreducible Cooper-channel couplings. It would be equally interesting to investigate the relative effect of the on-site repulsion $U$ on all quantities.

Acknowledgements. We thank B. Svistunov for discussions. This work was supported by the Simons Collaboration on the Many Electron Problem, the National Science Foundation under the grant PHY-1314735, the MURI Program “New Quantum Phases of Matter” from AFOSR, the Stiftelsen Olle Engkvist Byggmästare Foundation, and the Swedish Research Council grant 642-2013-7837. N.N. and A.S.M. are supported by Grant-in-Aids for Scientific Research (S) (No. 24224009) from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT) of Japan, and by ImPACT Program of Council for Science, Technology and Innovation (Cabinet office, Government of Japan).

14. We do not consider transverse phonons in this work because they (i) do not contribute to the discussion of the fundamental role played by screening effects, (ii) introduce additional model parameters irrelevant for purposes of this study, and (iii) are trivial to include in the proposed numerical scheme.
17. To have in place an efficient (diagram order independent) mechanism for verifying that the graph is irreducible, each line is assigned an auxiliary “momentum” and the momentum conservation law is enforced at each vertex. In irreducible graphs no two lines carry the same momentum—this can be quickly established with the help of the hashable trick.