

# CHCRUS

This is the accepted manuscript made available via CHORUS. The article has been published as:

Geometry of the charge density wave in the kagome metal math xmlns="http://www.w3.org/1998/Math/MathML">mi>A/mi> msub>mrow>mi mathvariant="normal">V/mi> /mrow>mn>3/mn>/msub>msub>mrow>mi>Sb/mi>/mrow >mn>5/mn>/msub>/math> H. Miao, H. X. Li, W. R. Meier, A. Huon, H. N. Lee, A. Said, H. C. Lei, B. R. Ortiz, S. D.

Wilson, J. X. Yin, M. Z. Hasan, Ziqiang Wang, Hengxin Tan, and Binghai Yan Phys. Rev. B **104**, 195132 — Published 18 November 2021 DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.104.195132

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

# Geometry of the charge density wave in kagomé metal AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>

H. Miao,<sup>1,\*</sup> H. X. Li,<sup>1</sup> W. R. Meier,<sup>1</sup> A. Huon,<sup>1</sup> H. N. Lee,<sup>1</sup> A. Said,<sup>2</sup> H. C. Lei,<sup>3</sup> B. R. Ortiz,<sup>4</sup>

S. D. Wilson,<sup>4</sup> J. X. Yin,<sup>5</sup> M. Z. Hasan,<sup>5</sup> Ziqiang Wang,<sup>6</sup> Hengxin Tan,<sup>7</sup> and Binghai Yan<sup>7</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Material Science and Technology Division, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, Tennessee 37831, USA

<sup>2</sup>Advanced Photon Source, Argonne National Laboratory, Argonne, Illinois 60439, USA

<sup>3</sup>Department of Physics and Beijing Key Laboratory of Opto-Electronic Functional

Materials and Micro-devices, Renmin University of China, Beijing, China

University of California Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara, California 93106, USA

<sup>5</sup>Laboratory for Topological Quantum Matter and Advanced Spectroscopy (B7),

Department of Physics, Princeton, New Jersey 08544, USA

<sup>6</sup>Department of Physics, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts 02467, USA

<sup>7</sup>Department of Condensed Matter Physics, Weizmann Institute of Science, Rehovot 7610001, Israel

(Dated: October 12, 2021)

Kagomé lattice is a fertile platform for topological and intertwined electronic excitations. Recently, experimental evidence of an unconventional charge density wave (CDW) is observed in a Z2 kagomé metal AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub> (A= K, Cs, Rb). This observation triggers wide interests on the interplay between frustrated crystal structure and Fermi surface instabilities. Here, we analyze the lattice effect and its impact on CDW in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>. Based on published experimental data, we show that the  $2\times2\times2$ CDW breaks the sixfold rotational symmetry of the crystal due to the phase shift between kagomé layers and can explain the twofold symmetric CDW peak intensity observed by scanning tunneling spectroscopy. The coupling between the lattice and electronic degrees of freedom yields a weak first order structural transition without continuous change of lattice dynamics. Our result emphasizes the fundamental role of lattice geometry in proper understanding of unconventional electronic orders in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>.

26 Kagomé lattice is a corner shared triangle network 54 that contains three sites per unit cell [1]. The elec- 55 27 tronic interference between the three sublattices gives 56 28 rise to flat band, van Hove singularity (saddle point) 57 29 and Dirac-fermion in its band structure. It has been 58 30 predicted that, near the van Hove filling, the combi- 59 31 nation of high density of state, sublattice interference 60 32 and non-local Coulomb interaction may yield unconven- 61 33 tional Fermi surface instabilities, such as the p-wave 62 34 charge and spin density waves, *d*-wave Pomeranchuk in- 63 35 stability and f-wave superconductivity [2–7]. Recently, a 64 36 three-dimensional charge density wave (CDW) that pos- 65 37 sibly intertwines with superconductivity is observed in a 66 38 kagomé metal  $AV_3Sb_5$  (A = K, Cs, Rb) [4, 8–20]. While 67 39 a three-dimensional  $2 \times 2 \times 2$  superstructure is experimen- 68 40 tally identified [14, 18, 21, 22], the nature of the CDW 69 41 and its interplay with the lattice degree of freedom are 70 42 under rigorous investigations. 71 43

Figures 1a and b show the crystal structure of  $AV_3Sb_5$ , <sup>72</sup> 44 which has a space group No. 191 (P6/mmm). The V-73 45 Sb slab interlaces with the alkali triangle network along 74 the crystal *c*-axis. Structurally, there are two Sb posi- 75 47 tions: Sb1 is located at the center of the V-hexagon and 76 48 Sb2 is sitting above and below the V-triangles. Den-77 49 sity functional theory (DFT) calculations found that the 78 50 ideal kagomé structure is energetically unstable and fa-51 vors an inverse star-of-David (ISD) structure at zero 52 temperature [12]. While the ISD distortion of the two-53

The diffraction intensity follows,  $I(\mathbf{Q}) = |F(\mathbf{Q})|^2$ , where  $F(\mathbf{Q})$  is the scattering amplitude. For a crystalline material,  $F(\mathbf{Q})$  can be formulated as:

\* miaoh@ornl.gov

79

80

81

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Materials Department and California Nanosystems Institute,

dimensional kagomé lattice preserves the  $D_{6h}$  symmetry, recent scanning tunneling spectroscopy (STS) studies found that the CDW superlattice peaks break the sixfold rotational symmetry (Fig. 1d), suggesting a chiral CDW or electronic nematicity [10, 15, 18, 28–30]. Magnetoresistence measurements also found evidence of  $C_2$ symmetry that persists into the superconducting phase [15, 30, 31]. Moreover, as we show in Fig. 1e, unlike wellknown CDW materials [23–27, 32–34], CDW in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub> fails to induce acoustic phonon anomalies near the CDW wavevector,  $\mathbf{Q}_{\text{CDW}}$ , indicating a strong commensurability effect [18]. Here, we explore the CDW by numerically and analytically assessing the structural responses below  $T_{\rm CDW}$  in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>. We show that the three-dimensional ISD structure yields a diffraction pattern that is consistent with x-ray scattering (XRD) and STS measurements [9, 10, 18, 28, 29]. Our analysis supports a CDW in  $AV_3Sb_5$  that preserves the  $D_{6h}$  in the kagomé-plane. However, due to the phase shift between kagomé layers, the CDW breaks the sixfold rotational symmetry,  $C_6$ , and strongly modifies the CDW superlattice peak intensities. Finally, we show that the coupling between CDW and lattice distortion yields a weak first order phase transition [21, 35] that may be responsible for the absence of acoustic phonon anomaly in  $AV_3Sb_5$  [18].



Figure 1. Crystal structure and CDW induced lattice distortion of AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>. (a) and (b) side-view and top-view of AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub> structure. DFT calculations find that the star-of-David (SD) is a local energy minimum at zero temperature, while ISD is the global minimum. (c) shows the SD and ISD lattice distortion of the V-kagomé lattice. Purple and black arrows show atomic distortions of V<sup>1-6</sup> and V<sup>7-12</sup> (see (b)), respectively. Distortions of V<sup>1-6</sup> and V<sup>7-12</sup> are out-of-phase. The ISD pattern corresponds to V<sup>1-6</sup>/V<sup>7-12</sup> moving toward/outward the center of the V-hexagon. (d) reproduces the STS determined CDW peak intensity near Q=0 [10]. The inset shows the Bragg (green) and CDW (purple) peaks in the momentum space. The coordinates are shown in reciprocal lattice units. (e) shows the longitudinal acoustic phonon dispersion at 300 and 50 K [18]. The dashed curves show acoustic phonon anomalies that are expected for strong electron-phonon driven CDW [23-27].

$$F(Q) = \underbrace{\sum_{R} e^{iQ \cdot R_n}}_{R} \underbrace{\sum_{j} f_j(Q) e^{iQ \cdot r_j}}_{j} = \delta_{Q=G} \underbrace{\sum_{j} f_j(Q) e^{iQ \cdot r_{j+2}}}_{j}^{109}$$

107

108

where  $\mathbf{R_n}$  and  $\mathbf{G}$  are real and reciprocal lattice vectors, 82 respectively.  $r_j$  is the  $j^{th}$  atomic position in the unit 83 cell. **Q** is the total momentum transfer and  $f_i(\mathbf{Q})$  is 84 the atomic form factor, which is derived from a Fourier 85 transformation of local density of state (see Appendix A 86 for more details). Below  $T_{\rm CDW}$ , the formation of CDW 87 distorts the high-temperature structure and gives rise to 88 superlattice peaks at  $\mathbf{Q} = \mathbf{Q}_{CDW}$ . 89

We first consider the DFT predicted ISD distortions<sup>116</sup> 90 of V-kagomé lattice. Figure 2a schematically shows the<sup>117</sup> 91 ISD distortion, where  $V^{1-6}$  and  $V^{7-12}$  are breathing out-92 of-phase with respect to the center of V-hexagon. Fig-93 ure 2b shows the simulated diffraction pattern of  $ISD^{120}$ 94 shown in Fig. 2a. The units and directions of the mo-95 mentum space are shown in Fig. 1d. The scattering re-96 gion is chosen to match previous XRD measurement at 97 L=0 plane [9, 18], which captures in-plane atomic dis-98 tortions. Remarkably, we find that ISD reproduces the 99 key feature of the experiment [9, 18], *i.e.*, the CDW peak<sub>121</sub> 100 intensity is significantly larger at  $\mathbf{Q} = (Odd, Int+0.5, 0)_{122}$ 101 or (Int+0.5, Odd, 0), than at  $\mathbf{Q}=(Even, Int+0.5, 0)_{123}$ 102 or (Int+0.5, Even, 0), where Even/Odd and Int rep-124 103 resent even/odd integers and integers, respectively. As<sub>125</sub> 104 a comparison, we also calculate two more CDW diffrac-126 105



Figure 2. CDW induced lattice distortions in real space and their corresponding diffraction patterns in momentum space. (a) and (b) ISD distortion on V-kagomé sublattice. (c) and (d) V-stretching distortion on V-kagomé sublattice, both of which preserve the  $D_{6h}$  symmetry in the kagomé plane. (e) and (f) Sb1/Cs distortion that has  $C_{3h}$  symmetry. In the diffraction calculations, the lattice distortions were set to be 1% deviating from the original positions. The units and directions of the momentum space are shown in Fig. 1d. The size of the dots proportional to the intensity of the diffraction pattern.

tion patterns: (i) the V-stretching shown in Fig. 2c, corresponding to an in-phase breathing of  $V^{1-6}$  and  $V^{7-12}$ and preserving the  $D_{6h}$  symmetry; and (ii) the inversionsymmetry breaking Cs/Sb1 distortion with  $C_{3h}$  symmetry as shown Fig. 1e. Apparently, these lattice distortions are incompatible with the empirical selection rules and can be excluded for AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>. To understand the XRD pattern, we calculate the diffraction amplitude of V-kagome lattice:

$$F(\mathbf{Q}) = 2\{\cos(\pi H(1+\delta)) + \cos(\pi K(1+\delta)) + \cos(\pi (H-K)(1+\delta)) + \cos(\pi (H+K)(1+\epsilon)) + \cos(\pi (2H-K)(1+\epsilon)) + \cos(\pi (2K-H)(1+\epsilon)) \}$$
(2)

where  $\delta$  and  $\epsilon$  correspond to  $V^{1-6}$  and  $V^{7-12}$  distortions, respectively. We assume  $|\delta|, |\epsilon| \ll a_0 = 5.4949 \text{\AA}$ , which are justified by previous XRD measurement, where the CDW superlattice peaks are  $3\sim 5$  orders smaller than their nearby fundamental Bragg peaks [18]. Expanding Eq. 2 to the order of  $\mathcal{O}(\delta, \epsilon)$ :

$$F(\mathbf{Q}) \propto \begin{cases} (H - 2K)(\delta + \epsilon) & (even, Int + 0.5, 0) \\ H(\delta + 3\epsilon) & (odd, Int + 0.5, 0) \end{cases}$$
(3)

For ISD,  $\epsilon$  and  $\delta$  have opposite sign with  $(\delta + \epsilon) \sim 0$ . Therefore, the CDW superlattice peaks at (even, Int+0.5, 0) are nearly vanishing. We shall note that the star-of-David (SD) distortion [12, 22] also captures the main feature of XRD measurement with subtle differences from ISD structure (see Appendix C). A more



Figure 3.  $C_2$  CDW peak intensity. (a) and (b) show cal-<sup>174</sup> culated CDW superlattice peak intensity at L=1.5 and 2, respectively. (c) shows the fundamental Bragg peak inten-<sup>176</sup> sity. The calculation is based on the theoretically refined ISD<sup>177</sup> structure [12]. The size of the dots are proportional to the<sup>178</sup> intensity of the diffraction pattern.<sup>179</sup>

detailed x-ray diffraction measurement and structure re-182
finement are required to distinguish between these two183
patterns [12].

Since the two-dimensional ISD/SD has the  $D_{6h}$  sym-185 metry, the CDW superlattice peaks are expected to show

 $C_6$  symmetry. Indeed, based on Eq. 1 and the ISD/SD distortion, we find that:

$$F(0.5,0,0) = F(0,0.5,0) \tag{4}^{187}$$

180

181

$$= F(-0.5, 0.5, 0) \approx -2\pi(\delta + \epsilon) \tag{4)_{188}}$$

The  $C_6$  symmetry of the CDW superlattice peak is, how-190 134 ever, incompatible with recent STS studies, where only<sup>191</sup> 135 a  $C_2$  symmetry is observed [10, 18, 28, 29]. As we con-192 136 tinue to show below, when CDW is three-dimensional<sub>193</sub> 137 (3D), as reported by recent experimental studies [16, 18, 194] 138 21, 22, 36], the  $C_6$  symmetry of the CDW peak inten-195 139 sity naturally breaks down to  $C_2$  symmetry. To show the 196 140 rotational symmetry breaking, we use the theoretically 197 141 refined  $2 \times 2 \times 2$  ISD structure of AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub> [12]. Due to the 198 142  $\pi$  phase shift between adjacent kagomé layers, the crystal<sup>199</sup> 143 symmetry is lowered from  $D_{6h}$  to  $D_{2h}$  [7]. Figure 3a and<sub>200</sub> 144 b show the calculated CDW superlattice peak intensity<sub>201</sub> 145 at L = 1.5 and L = 2, respectively. In agreement with<sub>202</sub> 146 STS studies [16, 18, 21, 22, 36], the CDW superlattice<sup>203</sup> 147 peak intensity only shows  $C_2$  symmetry. In contrast, the<sup>204</sup> 148 fundamental Bragg peak only weakly breaks the  $C_6$  sym-205 149 metry due to small lattice distortions. We note that in<sub>206</sub> 150 our simulation, the fundamental Bragg peak intensity is<sub>207</sub> 151 three-orders larger than the CDW peak intensity. 208 152

Theoretically, three types of CDW order parameters<sub>209</sub> 153 are predicted for AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>, the onsite CDW, bond CDW<sub>210</sub> 154 and imaginary bond CDW involving flux or loop cur-211 155 rents [4, 5, 7, 36, 37]. Due to finite electron-phonon cou-212 156 pling, CDW patterns have to respect the point group<sub>213</sub> 157 symmetry of the lattice. For instance, the Sb/Cs1 dis-214 158 tortion shown in Fig. 2e is derived from an onsite CDW215 159 with  $C_{3h}$  symmetry [37]. Our simulations demonstrate<sup>216</sup> 160 that the DFT calculated  $2 \times 2 \times 2$  superstructure at zero<sub>217</sub> 161 temperature is consistent with experimental observations<sup>218</sup> 162 and therefore support a CDW with  $D_{6h}$  symmetry in<sub>219</sub> 163 the kagomé plane. Furthermore, as shown in Fig. 2a-220 164 d, the anti-phase breathing of  $V^{1-6}$  and  $V^{7-12}$  puts an-221 165

other constraint on the CDW pattern in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub> [37]. Our results, however, do not explain the observed chiral CDW peak intensity in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub> [10]. Indeed, the chiral CDW keeps the  $D_{6h}$  symmetry of the kagomé plane [4] and hence cannot be distinguished by non-resonant x-ray scattering. Instead, the V *L*-edge resonant x-ray scattering, which selectively enhance electronic excitions from V 3*d*-orbital, might be a sensitive probe for this novel electronic order parameter [38].

Finally, we explore how lattice distortion intertwines with the CDW transition. Previous DFT calculations [12] found that the lattice energy is asymmetric with respect to the lattice distortion,  $\eta$ , at zero temperature (Fig. 4). Since CDW always couples with lattice distortions through finite electron-phonon coupling, the asymmetric lattice-distortion energy adds a cubic term in the CDW free energy and leads to a weak first order phase transition. To elaborate it further, we consider an Isingtype Landau free energy on a two-dimensional kagomé lattice:

$$F(T,\psi) - F_0 = A(T)\psi^2 - C\psi^3 + B\psi^4$$
 (5)

where  $\psi \sim \Delta_{CDW} \sim \eta$ . Note the linear term in Eq. 5 can be removed by a linear transformation of  $\psi$ .  $\Delta_{CDW}$ is the CDW gap in single particle spectral function. Cis a constant that is proportional to the electron-phonon coupling strength. The hysteresis of the first order phase transition is,  $\Delta T = \frac{C^2}{4AB}$ . Experimentally,  $\Delta T \sim 1$  K [21, 35], suggesting a weak electron phonon coupling in AV<sub>3</sub>Sb<sub>5</sub>. Indeed, the calculated electron-phonon coupling constant from ref. [12] is in the weak coupling regime and between 0.3-0.46 for  $AV_3Sb_5$ , supporting our conclusion. Due to the weak first order phase transition, the change of the lattice dynamics is discontinuous near  $T_{\rm CDW}$  and possibly intervenes the softening of the CDW phason mode. Together with the strong commensurability effect of the  $2 \times 2 \times 2$  CDW, the phason gap may remain large above  $T_{\rm CDW}$  and failed to yield acoustic phonon softening near the CDW wavevector [18]. It is important to note that the first-order CDW transition is also possible in a pure electronic model without electron-phonon coupling [6, 7]. In this scenario, neither the CDW phason mode nor the acoustic phonon mode soften by cooling towards the  $T_{\rm CDW}$ .

In summary, we explored the intricate interplay between lattice geometry and CDW in kagomé metal  $AV_3Sb_5$ . We prove that the ISD distortion reproduces the XRD and STS measurements. We showed that the coupling between lattice distortions and CDW induces a weak first order transition without continuous phonon softening in  $AV_3Sb_5$ .

Acknowledgements: We thank Kun Jiang for stimulating discussion on the interplay between CDW patterns and lattice distortions and Yimian Yang for technical supports. This research was sponsored by the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Basic Energy Sciences, Materials Sciences and Engineering Division and by the Laboratory Directed Research and Development



Figure 4. CDW-lattice coupling induced weak first order phase transition. At high temperature, the ideal kagomé lattice is stable and corresponding to the free energy minimum. At zero temperature, ISD is the energy minimum while SD is a local minimum. Near  $T_{\rm CDW}$ , the asymmetric lattice free energy adds a cubic term in the CDW free energy through electron-phonon coupling, which, consequently, drive the CDW transition to a weak first order transition.

Program of Oak Ridge National Laboratory, managed by<sub>251</sub> 222

250

261

262

263

264

265

- UT-Battelle, LLC, for the U.S. Department of Energy. 252 223
- H.C.L. was supported by National Natural Science Foun-224
- dation of China (Grant No. 11822412 and 11774423), 225
- Ministry of Science and Technology of China (Grant<sup>253</sup> 226 No. 2018YFE0202600 and 2016YFA0300504) and Bei-
- 227
- jing Natural Science Foundation (Grant No. Z200005).254 228 Z.Q.W is supported by the U.S. Department of Energy, 255 229 Basic Energy Sciences Grant No. DE-FG02-99ER45747.256 230 B.Y. acknowledges the financial support by the Will-257 231 ner Family Leadership Institute for the Weizmann In-258 232 stitute of Science, the Benoziyo Endowment Fund for 233 the Advancement of Science, Ruth and Herman Albert 234 Scholars Program for New Scientists, the European Re-235 search Council (ERC) under the European Unions Hori-236 zon 2020 research and innovation programme (Grant No.<sup>259</sup> 237 815869) and ISF MAFAT Quantum Science and Technol-<sup>260</sup> 238
- ogy (2074/19). 239

### Appendix A: Atomic structure factor 240

The atomic form factor is a Fourier transform of a 241 spatial density distribution of the scattering object. It 242 is defined as: 243

$$f(\boldsymbol{Q}) = \int \rho(\boldsymbol{r}) e^{i\boldsymbol{Q}\cdot\boldsymbol{r}} d^3\boldsymbol{r}$$
 (A1)

where  $\rho(\mathbf{r})$  is the real space electron density. For non-<sub>267</sub> 244 resonant x-ray scattering, the atomic form factor is well<sub>268</sub> 245 approximated by a sum of Gaussians of the form: 269 246

$$f(\mathbf{Q}) = \sum_{i=1}^{4} a_i exp(-b_i(\frac{\mathbf{Q}}{4\pi})^2) + c \qquad (A2)^{270}$$

The coefficients in Eq. A2 can be found in [39]. When<sup>271</sup> 247 considering the lattice vibrations, the atomic form  ${\rm factor}^{^{272}}$ 248 273 will be modified to: 249 274

$$f^{DW}(\boldsymbol{Q}) = f(\boldsymbol{Q})e^{-\frac{1}{2}\boldsymbol{Q}^2\langle u_Q^2\rangle} \equiv f(\boldsymbol{Q})e^{-M}$$
(A3)<sub>275</sub>



Figure 5. Simulated diffraction intensity. (a) V-SD distortion and (b) V-ISD distortion. In the diffraction calculations, the lattice distortions were set to be 1% deviating from the original positions. The size of the dots are proportional to the intensity of the diffraction pattern.

where  $\langle u_Q^2 \rangle$  is the time averaged mean of squared atomic displacement. In our calculation, Debye-Waller factor has been neglected.

# **Appendix B: Structural domain**

We consider the  $2 \times 2 \times 2$  superstructure which involves a  $\pi$ -phase shift between the ISD distorted kagomé layers. Assuming the scattering pattern of the two-dimensional ISD structure is  $I^{2\times 2}(\vec{Q})$ , the scattering intensity of  $2 \times 2 \times 2$  can be written as:

$$I^{2 \times 2 \times 2}(\mathbf{Q}) = I^{2 \times 2}(\mathbf{Q}) * |(1 + e^{i\mathbf{Q} \cdot \mathbf{T}})|^2$$
(B1)

where  $T_{a,b,c} = (1, 0, 1)$  or (0, 1, 1) or (1, -1, 1) in the high temperature reciprocal lattice unit. For a measurement in a single structural domain, such as STS, Eq. B2 post strong selection rule. For instance, take  $T_a = (1, 0, 1)$ , the CDW peak at (0.5, 0, 0) is actually forbidden. For a measurement that covers multiple domains, such x-ray measurement:

$$I^{2 \times 2 \times 2}(\boldsymbol{Q}) = I^{2 \times 2}(\boldsymbol{Q}) * (|1 + e^{i\boldsymbol{Q} \cdot \boldsymbol{T}_a}|^2 + |1 + e^{i\boldsymbol{Q} \cdot \boldsymbol{T}_b}|^2 + |1 + e^{i\boldsymbol{Q} \cdot \boldsymbol{T}_c}|^2) \\ \propto I^{2 \times 2}(\boldsymbol{Q})$$
(B2)

Therefore, the CDW superlattice peaks determined by multi-domain measurements will be similar to the  $2 \times 2$ CDW.

## Appendix C: Star-of-David distortion

Figure 5 compares diffraction patterns of SD and ISD distortions. While both distortions capture the empirical diffraction selection rules, SD and ISD show subtle differences, for instance, the relative intensity between (H, 13.5, 0 and (H, 12.5, 0) are opposite for SD and ISD.

- [1] I. Syzi, Statistics of Kagom Lattice,337 276 6, Progress of Theoretical Physics 306338 277 (1951).https://academic.oup.com/ptp/article-339 278 pdf/6/3/306/5239621/6-3-306.pdf. 340 279
- [2] W.-S. Wang, Z.-Z. Li, Y.-Y. Xiang, and Q.-H. Wang,<sup>341</sup>
   Competing electronic orders on kagome lattices at van<sup>342</sup>
   hove filling, Phys. Rev. B 87, 115135 (2013).
- [3] M. L. Kiesel, C. Platt, and R. Thomale, Unconventional<sup>344</sup>
   fermi surface instabilities in the kagome hubbard model,<sup>345</sup>
   Phys. Rev. Lett. **110**, 126405 (2013). 346
- [4] X. Feng, K. Jiang, Z. Wang, and J. Hu, Chiral flux<sup>347</sup>
   phase in the kagome superconductor av<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021),<sup>348</sup>
   arXiv:2103.07097 [cond-mat.supr-con].
  - [5] M. M. Denner, R. Thomale, and T. Neupert, Analysis<sup>350</sup> of charge order in the kagome metal av<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (a =k,rb,cs)<sup>351</sup> (2021), arXiv:2103.14045 [cond-mat.str-el].

289

290

291

- [6] Y.-P. Lin and R. M. Nandkishore, Complex charge den-353
  sity waves at van hove singularity on hexagonal lattices:354
  Haldane-model phase diagram and potential realization355
  in kagome metals av<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021), arXiv:2104.02725 [cond-356
  mat.supr-con].
- [7] T. Park, M. Ye, and L. Balents, Electronic instabilities of 358
   kagome metals: saddle points and landau theory (2021), 359
   arXiv:2104.08425 [cond-mat.supr-con]. 360
- [8] B. R. Ortiz, L. C. Gomes, J. R. Morey, M. Winiarski, 361 300 M. Bordelon, J. S. Mangum, I. W. H. Oswald, 362 301 J. A. Rodriguez-Rivera, J. R. Neilson, S. D. Wil-363 302 son, E. Ertekin, T. M. McQueen, and E. S. To-364 303 berer, New kagome prototype materials: discovery of<sub>365</sub> 304  $kv_3sb_5, rbv_3sb_5, \ and \ csv_3sb_5, \ Phys. Rev. Materials <math display="inline">{\bf 3}_{,366}$ 305 094407 (2019). 306 367
- 307[9] B. R. Ortiz, S. M. L. Teicher, Y. Hu, J. L. Zuo, P. M.368308Sarte, E. C. Schueller, A. M. M. Abeykoon, M. J.369309Krogstad, S. Rosenkranz, R. Osborn, R. Seshadri, L. Ba-370310lents, J. He, and S. D. Wilson,  $Csv_3sb_5$ : A  $F_2$  topologi-371311cal kagome metal with a superconducting ground state, 372312Phys. Rev. Lett. **125**, 247002 (2020).
- [10]Y.-X. Jiang, J.-X. Yin, M. M. Denner, N. Shumiya, B. R.374 313 Ortiz, G. Xu, Z. Guguchia, J. He, M. S. Hossain, X. Liu, 375 314 J. Ruff, L. Kautzsch, S. S. Zhang, G. Chang, I. Belopol-376 315 ski, Q. Zhang, T. A. Cochran, D. Multer, M. Litskevich, 377 316 Z.-J. Cheng, X. P. Yang, Z. Wang, R. Thomale, T. Ne-378 317 upert, S. D. Wilson, and M. Z. Hasan, Unconventional<sub>379</sub> 318 chiral charge order in kagome superconductor KV3Sb5,380 319 Nature Materials 10.1038/s41563-021-01034-y (2021). 381 320
- [11] Q. Yin, Z. Tu, C. Gong, Y. Fu, S. Yan, and H. Lei, Su-382
   perconductivity and normal-state properties of kagome383
   metal rbv3sb5 single crystals, Chinese Physics Letters 38,384
   037403 (2021).
- I12] H. Tan, Y. Liu, Z. Wang, and B. Yan, Charge den-386
   sity waves and electronic properties of superconducting387
   kagome metals (2021), arXiv:2103.06325 [cond-mat.supr-388
   con].
- [13] H. Zhao, H. Li, B. R. Ortiz, S. M. L. Teicher,390
  T. Park, M. Ye, Z. Wang, L. Balents, S. D. Wil-391
  son, and I. Zeljkovic, Cascade of correlated electron392
  states in a kagome superconductor csv3sb5 (2021),393
  arXiv:2103.03118 [cond-mat.supr-con]. 394
- [14] Z. Liang, X. Hou, W. Ma, F. Zhang, P. Wu, Z. Zhang,<sup>395</sup>
   F. Yu, J. J. Ying, K. Jiang, L. Shan, Z. Wang, and X. H.<sup>396</sup>
   Chen, Three-dimensional charge density wave and robust<sup>397</sup>

zero-bias conductance peak inside the superconducting vortex core of a kagome superconductor  $csv_3sb_5$  (2021), arXiv:2103.04760 [cond-mat.supr-con].

- [15] H. Chen, H. Yang, B. Hu, Z. Zhao, J. Yuan, Y. Xing, G. Qian, Z. Huang, G. Li, Y. Ye, Q. Yin, C. Gong, Z. Tu, H. Lei, S. Ma, H. Zhang, S. Ni, H. Tan, C. Shen, X. Dong, B. Yan, Z. Wang, and H.-J. Gao, Roton pair density wave and unconventional strong-coupling superconductivity in a topological kagome metal (2021), arXiv:2103.09188 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [16] F. H. Yu, T. Wu, Z. Y. Wang, B. Lei, W. Z. Zhuo, J. J. Ying, and X. H. Chen, Concurrence of anomalous hall effect and charge density wave in a superconducting topological kagome metal (2021), arXiv:2102.10987 [cond-mat.str-el].
- [17] K. Y. Chen, N. N. Wang, Q. W. Yin, Z. J. Tu, C. S. Gong, J. P. Sun, H. C. Lei, Y. Uwatoko, and J. G. Cheng, Double superconducting dome and triple enhancement of tc in the kagome superconductor csv3sb5 under high pressure (2021), arXiv:2102.09328 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [18] H. X. Li, T. T. Zhang, T. Yilmaz, Y. Y. Pai, C. Marvinney, A. Said, Q. Yin, C. Gong, Z. Tu, E. Vescovo, C. S. Nelson, R. G. Moore, S. Murakami, H. C. Lei, H. N. Lee, B. Lawrie, and H. Miao, Observation of unconventional charge density wave without acoustic phonon anomaly in kagome superconductors av<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (a=rb,cs) (2021), arXiv:2103.09769 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [19] X. Zhou, Y. Li, X. Fan, J. Hao, Y. Dai, Z. Wang, Y. Yao, and H.-H. Wen, Origin of the charge density wave in the kagome metal csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> as revealed by optical spectroscopy (2021), arXiv:2104.01015 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [20] Z. X. Wang, Q. Wu, Q. W. Yin, Z. J. Tu, C. S. Gong, T. Lin, Q. M. Liu, L. Y. Shi, S. J. Zhang, D. Wu, H. C. Lei, T. Dong, and N. L. Wang, Unconventional charge density wave and photoinduced lattice symmetry change in kagome metal csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> probed by time-resolved spectroscopy (2021), arXiv:2105.11393 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [21] D.W.Song, L.X.Zheng, F.H.Yu, J.Li, L.P.Nie, M.Shan, D.Zhao, S.J.Li, B.L.Kang, Z.M.Wu, Y.B.Zhou, K.L.Sun, K.Liu, X.G.Luo, Z.Y.Wang, J.J.Ying, X.G.Wan, T.Wu, and X. H. Chen, Orbital ordering and fluctuations in a kagome superconductor csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021), arXiv:2104.09173 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [22] B. R. Ortiz, S. M. L. Teicher, L. Kautzsch, P. M. Sarte, J. P. C. Ruff, R. Seshadri, and S. D. Wilson, Fermi surface mapping and the nature of charge density wave order in the kagome superconductor csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021), arXiv:2104.07230 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [23] C. M. Varma and A. L. Simons, Strong-coupling theory of charge-density-wave transitions, Phys. Rev. Lett. 51, 138 (1983).
- [24] H. Miao, D. Ishikawa, R. Heid, M. Le Tacon, G. Fabbris, D. Meyers, G. D. Gu, A. Q. R. Baron, and M. P. M. Dean, Incommensurate phonon anomaly and the nature of charge density waves in cuprates, Phys. Rev. X 8, 011008 (2018).
- [25] F. Weber, S. Rosenkranz, J.-P. Castellan, R. Osborn, R. Hott, R. Heid, K.-P. Bohnen, T. Egami, A. H. Said, and D. Reznik, Extended phonon collapse and the origin of the charge-density wave in 2h-nbse<sub>2</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **107**, 107403 (2011).

- F. Weber, S. Rosenkranz, J.-P. Castellan, R. Osborn,
   G. Karapetrov, R. Hott, R. Heid, K.-P. Bohnen, and
   A. Alatas, Electron-phonon coupling and the soft phonon431
- 401 mode in tise<sub>2</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **107**, 266401 (2011). 432
- 402 [27] A. Kogar, M. S. Rak, S. Vig, A. A. Husain, F. Flicker,433
  403 Y. I. Joe, L. Venema, G. J. MacDougall, T. C. Chiang,434
  404 E. Fradkin, J. van Wezel, and P. Abbamonte, Signatures435
  405 of exciton condensation in a transition metal dichalco-436
- 406 genide, Science **358**, 1314 (2017).
- [28] H. Li, H. Zhao, B. R. Ortiz, T. Park, M. Ye, L. Balents,438
  Z. Wang, S. D. Wilson, and I. Zeljkovic, Rotation symme-439
  try breaking in the normal state of a kagome supercon-440
  ductor kv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021), arXiv:2104.08209 [cond-mat.supr-441
  conl. 442
- [29] N. Shumiya, M. S. Hossain, J.-X. Yin, Y.-X. Jiang,443
  B. R. Ortiz, H. Liu, Y. Shi, Q. Yin, H. Lei, S. S.444
  Zhang, G. Chang, Q. Zhang, T. A. Cochran, D. Multer,445
  M. Litskevich, Z.-J. Cheng, X. P. Yang, Z. Guguchia,446
  S. D. Wilson, and M. Z. Hasan, Tunable chiral447
- charge order in kagome superconductor rbv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021),448
  arXiv:2105.00550 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [30] Y. Xiang, Q. Li, Y. Li, W. Xie, H. Yang, Z. Wang, Y. Yao, 450
  and H.-H. Wen, Twofold symmetry of c-axis resistivity in451
  topological kagome superconductor csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> with in-plane452
  rotating magnetic field (2021), arXiv:2104.06909 [cond-453
  mat.supr-con]. 454
- 424 [31] S. Ni, S. Ma, Y. Zhang, J. Yuan, H. Yang, Z. Lu,455
   N. Wang, J. Sun, Z. Zhao, D. Li, S. Liu, H. Zhang,456
   H. Chen, K. Jin, J. Cheng, L. Yu, F. Zhou, X. Dong,457
- J. Hu, H.-J. Gao, and Z. Zhao, Anisotropic Supercon-458
- 428 ducting Properties of Kagome Metal {CsV}3Sb5, Chi-

nese Physics Letters 38, 57403 (2021).

437

- [32] T. M. Rice and G. K. Scott, New mechanism for a chargedensity-wave instability, Phys. Rev. Lett. 35, 120 (1975).
- [33] M. Hoesch, A. Bosak, D. Chernyshov, H. Berger, and M. Krisch, Giant kohn anomaly and the phase transition in charge density wave zrte<sub>3</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **102**, 086402 (2009).
- [34] G. Grüner, Density Waves in Solids (CRC Press, Taylor & Francis Group, Boca Raton, 2018) pp. 1–288.
- [35] C. Mu, Q. Yin, Z. Tu, C. Gong, H. Lei, Z. Li, and J. Luo, s-wave superconductivity in kagome metal csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> revealed by <sup>121/123</sup>sb nqr and <sup>51</sup>v nmr measurement (2021), arXiv:2104.06698 [cond-mat.supr-con].
- [36] N. Ratcliff, L. Hallett, B. R. Ortiz, S. D. Wilson, and J. W. Harter, Coherent phonon spectroscopy and interlayer modulation of charge density wave order in the kagome metals csv<sub>3</sub>sb<sub>5</sub> (2021), arXiv:2104.10138 [condmat.supr-con].
- [37] X. Feng, Y. Zhang, K. Jiang, and J. Hu, Low-energy effective theory and symmetry classification of flux phases on kagome lattice (2021), arXiv:2106.04395 [cond-mat.suprcon].
- [38] A. J. Achkar, M. Zwiebler, C. Mcmahon, F. He, R. Sutarto, I. Djianto, Z. Hao, G. D. Gu, A. Revcolevschi, H. Zhang, Y. Kim, J. Geck, and D. G. Hawthorn, Nematicity in stripe ordered cuprates probed via resonant x-ray scattering, Science **351**, 1 (2016).
- [39] P. J. Brown, A. G. Fox, E. N. Maslen, M. A. O'Keefe, and B. T. M. Willis, Intensity of diffracted intensities, International Tables for Crystallography C, 554 (2006).